1	
2	
3	
4	
5	AUDIO TRANSCRIPTION OF THE
6	TOWN OF JAMES ISLAND BOARD OF ZONING APPEALS MEETING
7	APRIL 17, 2018
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	(Due to the quality of the recorded media, portions
13	were unable to be transcribed and include inaudible
14	portions. The transcript may also include
15	misinterpreted words and/or unidentified speakers.
16	The transcriber was not present at the time of the
17	recording; therefore, this transcript should not be
18	considered verbatim.)
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	TRANSCRIBED BY: MELISSA J. LANE, CSR/CCR/RPR
24	
25	

	April 18, 20
1	(Pledge of allegiance was held.)
2	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: This meeting has been
3	noticed in compliance with the South Carolina with
4	the Freedom Information Act. Fifteen days prior to
5	this hearing, a public hearing notice was printed in
6	the Post and Courier. A sign was posted on the
7	designated properties and a notice was mailed to the
8	applicant or representative property owners and to
9	property owners within 300 feet of the applications
10	and to parties of interest
11	Persons, organizations and the news media
12	that have requested declaration of our meeting have
13	also been notified. The Freedom of Information Act
14	does not require notification of anyone other than the
15	applicant and parties of interest.
16	The board members who will hear your case
17	tonight are myself. My name is Brook Lyon. I'm the
18	chairperson. Jason Gregorie, vice chairperson, Sim
19	Parrish and Rov Smith. Staff members present are our

attorney, Bo Wilson. Is Brandon Reeser here tonight as well?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: He is.

CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Okay. Great. Brandon

24 Reeser.

20

21

22

23

25

Hi, Mr. Reeser. He is also our attorney.

1	March 20th meeting was included in your packets.
2	Are there any changes? If not, may I have
3	a motion to approve and a second?
4	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: So moved.
5	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Second.
6	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Any discussion? All in
7	favor aye.
8	(All said aye.)
9	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Aye. Opposed? The
10	motion carries unanimously.
11	Our case rulings from this and any BZA
12	meeting are available for public review and inspection
13	during normal business hours at town hall.
14	At this time I would like to explain to the
15	public the workings of the BZA. The Board of Zoning
16	Appeals is a quasi-judicial body established to
17	interpret and grant relief from the zoning and land
18	development regulations ordinance. The Board of
19	Zoning Appeals has jurisdiction over three types of
20	cases: Appeals, variances and special exceptions.
21	Special exceptions are an exception issued
22	by the BZA authorizing a particular use in a specified
23	location within a zoning district, upon demonstrating
24	that such use complies with all the conditions and
25	standards developed by the Town of James Island Zoning

and Land Development Regulations Ordinance.

Variances may be granted when strict application of the zoning ordinance would cause an unnecessary hardship. This board's action must be based on specific standards as contained in the South Carolina Local Government Planning Enabling Act of 1994 and the Town of James Island Zoning and Land Development Regulations Ordinance.

A simple majority vote of the quorum present is required to grant a variance and special exception. It must be understood that the rules of your neighborhood or subdivision are binding and we can take no action that will negate their jurisdiction over your property. Our purpose tonight is for interested parties to be heard in order to assist the board in gathering evidence pertinent to each case. If the members of the BZA feel the need for further information to clarify a case, the board has the authority to subpoena witnesses.

In addition to your testimony, our board has been presented written information submitted to the staff by the applicant or their agent for each case. This information is now considered to be evidence and is entered into the permanent record of this body. It is assumed that it is complete, true

and accurate. Also, we have been presented data assembled by the staff for the purpose of clarifying the location and the effect on surrounding property.

Our board is empowered to approve, approve with conditions or deny your request. We are also authorized to defer a case should there be a need to obtain additional information. The board has received additional information from the applicant and public since BZA packets were completed. This information and letters and e-mails were forwarded to BZA members electronically and a hard copy has been presented as well. This information will be entered into the permanent records of these cases. If an applicant's request is disapproved and they wish to appeal the decision of this board concerning their case, appeals must be addressed to the circuit court.

South Carolina Code 6-29-820 states that the appeal must be filed by the applicant within 30 days after the decision of the board is mailed to them. Failure to file an appeal within the time limit deprives the court the jurisdiction to hear the matter.

Because this is a quasi-judicial body, everything said in this meeting must be complete, true and accurate. All of the information provided to the

1	BZA is considered evidence, and this board may certify
2	contempt of circuit court if false statements are
3	made, either in writing or orally.
4	At this time I would like to ask the board
5	if you think we need to enter into executive session
6	to discuss the appropriately legal standards with
7	respect to these applications or defer after the
8	presentation or not. Not enter.
9	Does anyone have any questions that you
10	need to ask of our attorney, Bo?
11	Okay. Then we will not enter into
12	executive session at this time.
13	I would like if someone could please
14	hand me the sheets of the sign-in people, I would
15	appreciate that.
L 6	Do we have that up here yet, Ms. Simmons?
L7	It will help. Thank you.
L8	(Background noise in audio.)
L9	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Yeah. We will need that
20	soon. Thank you.
21	At this time our Attorney Wilson will
22	administer the oath to those presenting testimony.
23	Because of this, each person who wishes to address the
24	board will be sworn in. In order to expedite the
25	procedure if those wishing to speak, will please stand

1	As I just mentioned, the applicant,
2	according to our typical rules, are limited to five
3	minutes to present their case and two minutes to
4	rebut, and then those speaking for or against the case
5	is limited to two minutes each. These rules stand
6	unless it's changed by a majority vote of the board.
7	The applicant has made a formal request to waive the
8	time limit. Due to the amount of material, fairness
9	of the application, clear interest in the details by
10	the public and technical complexity, it may be prudent
11	to waive the time limit for presentation and rebuttal
12	by the applicant. In fairness to the public, it may
13	also be prudent to waive the comment time limit as
14	well.
15	So with that said, is there a motion from
16	the board to waive the applicant and public time
17	limits?
18	JASON GREGORIE: So moved.
19	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Second?
20	SIM PARRISH: Second.
21	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: All in favor to waive the
22	applicant and public time limits, say aye.
23	(All said aye.)
24	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Aye. Opposed?
25	JIM FRALIX: No.

1	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: For the record,
2	Mr. Fralix votes no. Mr. Parrish, Mr. Gregorie,
3	Ms. Lyon and Mr. Smith vote aye.
4	So for these for these cases, we will
5	not adhere to the time limits. Everyone will have a
6	chance to speak and be heard. We ask that you please
7	try to keep it reasonable, not be redundant. We've
8	got four pages up here as well as a very thorough and
9	involved presentation, and we'll look forward to
10	hearing you all.
11	Tonight we will hear two cases, special
12	exception request and one variance request. These
13	requests must meet all criteria of the ordinance, and
14	we will now hear case BZAS-3-18-015.
15	At this time I call Ms. Kristen Crane to
16	present.
17	KRISTEN CRANE: The applicant,
18	Mr. Christopher Orman (phonetic) of the Pavilion
19	Company is requesting a special exception for the
20	placement of a full-service car wash in the Community
21	Commercial District and the Folly Road Corridor
22	Overlay Zoning District at 765 and 761 Folly Road.
23	We have a radius map here that shows the
24	property hash as red community special. Yellow is
25	residential Town of James Island. White is general

business, City of Charleston.

2 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Could you possibly

3 | speak up? Can you be mic'd?

KRISTEN CRANE: Can you all hear me?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yes.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yes.

KRISTEN CRANE: Adjacent property to the north and to the south are zoned general business in the City of Charleston jurisdiction. To the west is marsh residential and general business zoned parcels, and they're in the City of Charleston's jurisdiction. The adjacent general business zoned property to the west is residential in nature while the adjacent general business zoned parcel to the south is vacant. The overlay's land use recommendation for the subject property of this commercial, which matches the current zoning district.

Do we have an aerial? Of the property —
this is 765, which is Huffs. Here's Pelicans, and
this is 761 TitleMax. Carlisle is right here. Folly
Road. Other uses within 300 feet of the subject
property includes restaurants, bar/lounge, medical
office, retail sales, retail of personal services,
animal services, offices, repair and maintenance
services and residential uses. The Town of James

Island Land Development Regulations, Folly Road
Corridor Overlay Zoning District, commercial four
states that uses requiring a special exception are
liquor, beer or wine sales, bar or lounge, consumer
vehicle repair, fast food restaurants, gasoline
service stations with or without convenient stores,
indoor recreation entertainment and vehicle service.

Here is a copy of the first site plan that was submitted. They have since resubmitted. The difference would be the right in, right out here with the T-bone and pervious pavement underneath the canopy of the tree.

In the letter of intent, the applicant explains, Pavilion feels confident that we can redevelop the site with a great use that would add to the Town of James Island protecting the marsh, cleaning up the site and preserving the live oak on site.

So I'll go through some pictures. So subject property, Huffs and Pelicans SnoBalls, and we have this picture is Folly Road at your back looking towards the marsh area. Here's the live oak tree. TitleMax property. This is 761 Folly. And here's the back of TitleMax with Folly Road right here. This is adjacent property. Across the street is Blue Water

convenient store. And to the west is residential and 1 marsh. Adjacent property at TitleMax. Again, this is 2 over here, property off of Carlisle right here. 3 This is looking south of Folly Road, looking north. 4 According to Section 153.0445-E, special exceptions 5 approval criteria of the Town of James Island Zoning 6 7 and Land Development Regulations Ordinance special exceptions may be approved only if the board finds 8 9 that the proposed use. 10 A, is consistent with the recommendations contained in the Town of James Island comprehensive 11

plan and the character of the underlying zoning and purpose of intent.

Response: The Town of James Island

Comprehensive Plan future categories states, a community commercial future use land category is intended to allow retail and service uses that serve

the residential population of the island and that do

not negatively impact the surrounding communities.

However, a land use strategy listed in the

comprehensive plan is to encourage commercial

structures that are in character with the suburban

nature of the area while a land use element need is

listed as encouraging, sensitive and sustainable

development practices. Additionally, the purpose and

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1	intent of the Folly Road Corridor Overlay Zoning
2	
3	
4	consistent land use and design standards with adjacent
5	jurisdictions and utilizing traffic safety measures
6	and access management for vehicles and pedestrians to
7	ensure safe and efficient traffic movement.
8	Therefore, this application may not be consistent with
9	the Town of James Island comprehensive plan as
10	implemented through the CC District.
11	B is compatible with existing uses in the
12	vicinity and will not adversely affect the general
13	welfare or character of the immediate community.
14	Response: The proposed use may be
15	compatible with other uses within the 300 feet of the
16	subject property to the north and the east including a
17	gas station and self-service car wash, but the subject
18	property is bordered by residential and wetland
19	property to the south and west.
20	
21	C, adequate provision is made for such
	items as setbacks, buffering, including fences and/or
22	landscaping to protect adjacent properties from the
23	possible adverse influence of the proposed use such as
24	noise, vibration, dust, glare, odor, traffic

congestion and similar factors.

1 Response: A comprehensive landscaping plan is required for buffer areas. Additionally, the 2 applicants' representatives states, moreover, Pavilion 3 intends to add privacy fencing along the south 4 property line. However, the proposed site plan 5 doesn't show protection from the possible adverse 6 influence of the proposed use such as noise and 7 vibration and similar factors for the residential 8 properties and marshland to the northwest and west, 9 where applicable will be developed in a way that will 10 11 preserve and incorporate any important natural 12 features. 13 The applicant is working with an arborist to ensure that there are no adverse effects to the 14 61-inch diameter of live oak tree from the development 15 of the site, which the letter of intent addresses. 16 The proposed plan will be of benefit to the health and 17 longevity of the tree, and the site plan also shows 18

longevity of the tree, and the site plan also shows that the wooded areas to the south is to remain woods. However, the applicant has applied for a grand tree canopy pavement encroachment.

E, complies with all applicable rules, regulations, laws and standards of this order including but not limited to any use conditions, zoning district standards or site plan review or

19

20

21

22

23

24

requirements of this ordinance.

Response: The applicant is in the process to ensure compliance with the applicable regulations.

And F, vehicular traffic and pedestrian movement on adjacent road shall not be hindered or endangered.

Response: The applicant proposed to install a 10-foot path of the length of the property narrowing around the grand tree. Pedestrian movement shall not be hindered or endangered. Vehicular traffic may be hindered due to the layout of the proposed site and the close proximity from the stacking area to Folly Road and from the impediment of the off-street parking spaces from the stacking area.

When granting a special exception, the board may attach to it such conditions regarding the location, character or other features of the proposed building or structure, as the board may concern revisable to protect established property values and the surrounding area or to promote the public, health, safety or general welfare.

The board may approve, approve with conditions or deny this case based on the findings of fact unless additional information is deemed necessary to make an informed decision.

In the event the board decides to approve this application, the board should consider the following conditions: Number one, prior to obtaining a zoning permit for the proposed site improvement, the applicant or owner shall install a tree barricade around the grand and protected trees on the property as described in Section 153.334 of the ordinance.

Number two, a separated 12-foot multiuse path along the frontage of the parcels shall be installed. Right-of-way buffers can be reduced to accommodate the path if the space is limited, and the zoning administrator shall be authorized to reduce the width of the required multiuse path, if conditions exist that would render the required width unfeasible.

Number three, a plan to expand stacking spaces in the event of traffic, parking and stacking congestions shall be submitted and approved by the town prior to obtaining a zoning permit for the proposed site improvements.

Number four, an eight-foot wooden privacy fence shall be installed along the entire rear perimeter and anywhere fence is labeled on submitted site plan.

And number five, architectural plan shall be subject to the discretion of the town as to whether

```
natural guidelines and development standards have been
  1
  2
     followed.
  3
                 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you so much,
  4
    Ms. Crane.
 5
                 KRISTEN CRANE: Uh-huh.
 6
                 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Are there any questions
 7
    from staff? From BZA members?
 8
                UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I think I do have a
    few. If I may go?
 9
10
                CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Absolutely.
11
                UNIDENTIFIED MALE:
                                     Thanks. Kristen --
12
                KRISTEN CRANE: Yes.
13
                UNIDENTIFIED MALE: -- so as far as the
14
    61-inch DBH tree --
15
                KRISTEN CRANE: Uh-huh.
16
                UNIDENTIFIED MALE: -- I've been on BZA for
    a few years, and I don't recall a tree -- us dealing
17
    with a tree of this magnitude in diameter. Do you
18
19
    recall us dealing with a tree of this size?
20
                KRISTEN CRANE: I do not, uh-uh.
21
                UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: We can't hear
22
    anything.
23
                (Background noise in audio.)
24
                UNIDENTIFIED MALE: So my question to
25
   Ms. Crane, I asked her --
```

1	UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Thank you.
2	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: if we have dealt
3	with a tree of this magnitude in diameter before at
4	the BZA level. She replied, no, we have not. There's
5	some other basic side information I have questions
6	about
7	KRISTEN CRANE: Okay.
8	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: that I didn't see on
9	here that I think is important and relevant for new
10	development especially in a coastal community. Is
11	this site in a flood zone?
12	KRISTEN CRANE: This site is in a flood
13	zone, yes.
14	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: And what flood zone is
15	it in?
16	KRISTEN CRANE: It is in AE-12.
17	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: And is AE-12 considered
18	a special flood hazard area?
19	KRISTEN CRANE: Yes.
20	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: And does the Town of
21	James Island have a floodplain ordinance or a flood
22	damage prevention ordinance?
23	KRISTEN CRANE: We do, uh-huh. We have the
24	same regulations that Charleston County does. We
25	adopted theirs by reference.

	The state of the s
1	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: And is this site, is
2	the ground of this property located below base flood
3	elevation?
4	KRISTEN CRANE: Yes.
5	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Okay. So just to
6	confirm, this property is in a special flood hazard
7	area, and it's located below base flood level.
8	KRISTEN CRANE: It is located in below base
9	flood level.
10	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you.
11	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Any other questions for
12	Ms. Crane?
13	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Not at this time.
14	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Not at this time. Thank
15	you so much.
16	KRISTEN CRANE: You're welcome.
17	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: At this time I'll call
18	the applicant, if you would come up and present your
19	case, please. I think there's several of you.
20	ROSS APPEL: Good evening, Chairman Lyon,
21	and members of the board of zoning appeals. My name
22	is Ross Appel. I'm the attorney for Pavilion
23	Development Company as well as Autobell, and I
24	appreciate the opportunity to address you this
25	evening, and I first want to before I get started,

	, juli 10, 201
1	I want to thank you for the accommodation on time.
2	Could everybody hear me in the back?
3	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: No.
4	ROSS APPEL: All right. Is this thing on?
5	
6	mic.
7	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Oh, no.
8	ROSS APPEL: Great.
9	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Oh, boy.
10	(Background noise in audio.)
11	ROSS APPEL: Okay. Great. All right.
12	This is an important issue, obviously. That's why so
13	many people are here in the audience today. That's
14	why we've assembled a team of professionals to address
15	all of the technical matters pertinent to this
16	project, and we look forward to having the opportunity
17	to present those issues to you today.
18	However, before we get started with the
19	full blown-up presentation, I want to go over some
20	very important issues with the board this evening.
21	The scope of this board's review from a legal standard
22	is of utmost importance tonight. To be perfectly
23	clear and to be respectfully blunt, the scope of
24	review for this board is not plenary. What I mean by
25	that is, this board does not get to just do whatever
1	

it wants. I'm going to read a couple of quotes before we get started. Quote, our ordinances --

CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Excuse me. Let's please not have crosstalk and let the applicant present their case. If everyone would please be quiet, and you'll get your turn to speak. Thank you.

ROSS APPEL: Thank you.

Quote, our ordinances -- referring to the Town of James Island's ordinances -- generally leave little room for discretion. Here's another quote, the town, and more specifically the town's BZA must apply our ordinances in a fair and reasonable way. unreasonable or arbitrary action by the BZA will only result in an appeals circuit court with the result of the car wash or worse will appear along with the town having to pay substantial legal fees. We must do things right. We must follow the proper procedures. Neither of these quotes are my words. These are the mayor's quotes of the Town of James Island that he posted on his blog, I think it was last week, and I'm hear to tell you, Mayor Woolsey is 100 percent right; okay? The scope of review is extremely important in this situation and that's what I'm going to focus my comments on today.

The bottom line is, tonight's special

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

exception application is not a referendum on whether 1 we like the idea of a car wash in general or whether 2 we like the idea of a car wash in this location. 3 is not a popularity contest. We believe that we meet 4 all the special exception criteria that Ms. Crane just ran through. However, we don't believe any of them apply in this situation. In fact, we don't even believe legally we should be here tonight on a special The basis for this is laid out in a legal memo that I sent to the town attorney last week.

Here's why. As Ms. Crane pointed out, both of the properties at issue in this case are zoned community commercial. That is the most intensive commercial zoning district the town has. legislature of this town, when they adopted their ordinances, identified these two pieces of property. And they said, you know what we're going to do? We're going to slate for these two pieces of property the most intensive types of commercial development possible under the town's ordinances and that's also reflected in the town's comprehensive plan, which says, going forward, the property shall be slated for commercial development. In other words, it is the policy of the Town of James Island expressed by the planning commission who developed the comprehensive

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

plan and the town council who adopted the comprehensive plan and the implementing zoning regulations to slate this -- these two properties for the most intensive commercial development available under the town zoning ordinances.

Those are the rights that our clients have today. The town didn't have to do that. The town could have slated these properties for conservation or for some other limited use. The town did not do that. That's going to be very important as we move forward.

So I just got finished saying, these uses are allowed by right. Under the commercial — the community commercial zoning designation, a defined term, vehicle service, comma, limited is allowed by right. When you look at the table of uses, vehicle services limited is provided by right in the community commercial district. And when you read the way that it's presented in the table of uses, after the phrase, vehicle services limited, town council enumerated certain specific examples of uses including car washes. They call out specifically car washes is an allowed use by right under the table of uses for the community commercial zoning district, and it's very important for two reasons: Obviously, because the use is allowed by right, number one. But, number two, it

signals that the legislative intent is that car washes are a type of vehicle service limited, limited, limited.

So why is a special exception required in 4 5 this case, according to staff? Well, staff takes the position that since we're in the Folly Road Corridor 6 Overlay Commercial area, we're subject to a special 7 exception requirement. But if you look at the actual 8 9 language that's used in the code under Section 153.093, Subsection H2, it -- it presents a laundry 10 11 list of certain uses that require the special exception device. Car washes are not included in that 12 list. Vehicle services limited is not included in 13 that list. Vehicle services, however, is included in 14 that list, and staff is taking the position that a 15 vehicle service use includes a car wash. It is our 16 position that a vehicle service use does not include a 17 18 car wash. It is our position that a vehicle service 19 use is a more intense use than a vehicle services limited car wash. I'm sorry, vehicle services limited 20 21 use, which includes a car wash. Vehicle services limited is a term of art that is defined under the 22 23 town zoning ordinance in their definition section. The town has a rule of statutory construction that 24 25 technical terms are to receive their legal definition

1

2

as expressed in the ordinance.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

To sum it all up, since vehicle services limited are not a special exception trigger under the overlay and car washes are not an enumerated use that requires a special exception under the overlay. We don't even have to be here for a special exception, and this is a legal objection that I want to note on the record for you this evening.

So your job is easy tonight. We don't have to even be subject to a special exception. However, if you happen to disagree with me, which wouldn't be the first time somebody's disagreed with me, although this case is pretty strong, we believe that the scope of your review is limited based on the language of the In other words, the scope of review before the board tonight is not whether a car wash is permitted, but rather, how is a car wash permitted? And the reason for that is, the purpose of the Folly Road Overlay District itself. The ordinance is very The purpose is not to regulate uses, per se, but rather to coordinate and harmonize development along an important commercial corridor that expands multiple local government jurisdictions and that makes We don't want to have a whole hodgepodge of different types of design and different approaches and

pedestrian features, buffering and landscaping and streetscape improvements. That all makes sense, and that's why the town adopted the overlay regulations.

In other words, the scope of review should you find that a — that a special exception is required under the overlay district is limited to certain features. Specifically, let's look to the language of the overlay itself, Section 153.093, subsection H. Quote, future development in this area should place high priority on pedestrian connectivity between businesses and neighborhoods with attractive planning streetscapes and building architecture. I—I've read the Folly Road Corridor Overlay maybe more times than anybody should. Those are the only objective criteria in the overlay itself.

There's three issues that town council identified as being substantive issues of concern.

Number one, pedestrian connectivity. Number two, planted streetscapes, and number three, architecture.

We've got a plan for addressing all three of those issues.

First, pedestrian connectivity. The default zoning regulations as applied to this piece of property require four-foot sidewalks. We've proposed 10, because we want to make sure that this -- these

properties post-development enhances a multimodel pedestrian functionality of Folly Road. Right now, currently, pedestrian issues onsite is disaster. I've been out there before walking in this outfit. It's not -- it's not good. We've proposed 10 feet. has proposed conditions of 12 feet. Guess what? We're happy with 12 feet. We have no problem with that condition.

Planned streetscapes. This is way early in the process. We haven't gotten to the site plan review phase. We're happy to make the streetscapes as beautiful as possible. We want this property to be as beautiful as possible. Autobell's projects around the southeast look great. That's what they pride themselves on. They look much better, frankly, than some of the traditional Legacy car washes that we're all familiar with on the island.

As far as architecture goes, yes, there is a standard Autobell design, so to speak. That standard Autobell design will never be on James Island. We've heard from the community. We've met with the community. They don't want the standard off the, you know, shelf Autobell design. We're not going to proceed with the standard Autobell design.

In the following presentation, you're going

to hear more details from people that are competent to speak about architecture, but the bottom line is, we're going to work with the Town of James Island on a design that is appropriate that fits and harmonizes with the surrounding developments, natural features, et cetera.

So those are the three issues under the overlay district, pedestrian connectivity, planned streetscapes and architecture. We have a plan to address all three. In other words, even assuming the special exception test applies in this situation, which we don't think is the case, those are the three issues for the board to consider tonight. It's not the laundry list of criteria whether we're consistent with the comp plan and all those various items you heard during the presentation. We don't need to get into that because that's not what the town council has already expressed for the property.

Here's another important provision in the town's overlay district, Section 1503.093-H1, quote, the uses allowed in the -- in the overlay, quote, shall include those allowed in the community commercial zoning district as indicated on the overlay map and is described in table 153.110, use table. That's town council putting an exclamation point on

1 the fact that the overlay district is not designed to regulate uses. It's not a second bite at the zoning 2 3 If you're allowed to proceed with a use under your base zoning, that doesn't change by virtue of you 4 being in the overlay. All that changes is we're going 5 to take a closer look at the design to make sure 6 you're addressing pedestrian connectivity, attractive, 7 8 you know, streetscaping and architecture.

To sum it all up, the overlay does not regulate uses. It regulates how uses are developed. As a third alternative, let's say Kristen's right, and you're -- we're subject to the full traditional special exception test. I'm going to run through those criteria because I think we have to, under the circumstances -- although, again, we don't believe we have to. The first criteria, quote, is consistent with the recommendations contained in the town's comprehensive plan and the character of the underlying zoning district purpose and intent. Town staff's report seems to think that we don't meet this. It's our suggestion -- rather, it's our contention that we easily meet this, and there's no question that we meet The property is zoned community commercial. this. It's the most intense commercial zoning district the Town of James Island has. A comprehensive plan

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

specifically targets these two parcels and says, you
know what we want to see here? Commercial
development. That's not me. That's the town council.
That's the mayor. That's the planning commission.
That is what they have -- the dye has already been
cast for these two properties. So the -- so to

address the special exception test, is this consistent with the zoning and the comprehensive plan, I mean, it's just not even a question.

Is -- the next criteria, quote, is compatible with existing uses within the vicinity and will not adversely affect the general welfare or character of the immediate community. These two properties are located on the most highly traveled commercial business district in the town. This is not off of Riverland or around the corner from town hall. There's nowhere on the island more appropriate for this use. The property is surrounded by commercial Uses zoned general business. Uses zoned community commercial. There's a gas station across the street. There's multiple shopping centers a few steps away. It will not adversely affect the general welfare or character of the immediate community, but my colleagues will speak more to the specific operational issues involved in -- in the development

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

and how the -- the negative byproducts of the car wash
process are all contained onsite, clean, recycled,
kept onsite, and frankly, will represent an enhanced
environmental situation on the property.

The third criteria, quote, adequate provision is made for such items as setbacks, buffering, including fencing or landscaping to protect adjacent properties from the possible adverse influence of the proposed use such as noise, vibration, dust, glare, odor, traffic congestion and similar factors. The zoning ordinance requires interior setbacks of 10. We're going with 14. The zoning ordinance requires sidewalks of four feet. We've proposed 10. The town has asked for 12. We're happy to do 12. The town has asked to do eight-foot privacy fencing. You've got eight-foot privacy fencing. Done deal.

Further, there's no incursion in the OCRM buffer or setbacks. In fact, the original design for this project did involve a variance from the OCRM setback. Our folks acquired an additional piece of property to move the entire development northward so we would have even less impact on the -- on the marsh, and we don't even need relief under the zoning ordinance for that.

So the bottom line is, we've incorporated all forms of mitigation to keep the negative issues surrounding the use from spilling over into neighboring properties. So we think we meet that criteria. We've got three more criteria.

I'm sorry, I'm just trying to hit everything.

Number four, quote, where applicable will be developed in a way that will preserve and incorporate any important natural features. There is a significant, beautiful grand tree on the property. This — this significance, beautiful grand tree on the property is going to be preserved and protected and enhanced as a product of this development. We have got experts here today that will testify as to that effect.

Furthermore, the marshes and everything else involving the creek and the natural features on the site, which by the way, makes this site a very unique piece of property and different in a variety of respects from its neighbors. All of those issues will be addressed, and my colleagues will speak to the ways that we manage water onsite, treat water onsite and prevent water from draining into the creek, which by the way, it rained a couple of days ago. All the rain

that hit these properties drained right into the creek
yesterday.

After this development, that situation will change because it will be brought up to modern code; okay? The status quo of the property right now isn't great. It may look, you know, traditional and things of that nature, but it's — there's a lot of environmental problems as it stands today that'll be fixed by virtue of this development. So we believe we meet the fourth requirement.

Number five complies with all applicable rules, regulations, laws and standards of this chapter, including but not limited to, any use conditions zoning district standards or site plan review of this chapter.

This is very important here. Believe it or not, special exception and a variance is not the only hurdle we have to cross in order to develop this piece of property. There are all kinds of other regulations, both local, state and maybe even federal that we have to comply with, and we will comply with. We have to comply with them. If we don't comply with them, we're not going to be —— we're not going to be green lighted here.

And this relates back to what I started

1	with, scope of review. The BZA is not the EPA. The
2	BZA is not OCRM. The BZA is not the floodplains
3	administrator. There are flood regulations that apply
4	to this property. We will meet them. We will design
5	to code to meet the flood regulations. If we don't,
6	we're not going to get permitted. We understand that.
7	But the BZA's job is not to take Kristen's job or
8	whoever whoever else you all have in the town to
9	administer the zoning ordinance. The scope of the
10	BZA's authority is limited to three things, special
11	exceptions, variances and appeals from Kristen. It's
12	not to enforce the floodplain regulations or anything
13	else. We will meet all the requirements that are
14	applicable because we have to, of course.

Number six, vehicular traffic and pedestrian movement on the adjacent roads will not be hindered or endangered. We've already talked about pedestrian connectivity, and the development is going to -- is going to represent a massive improvement of the status quo.

As for traffic, we have a traffic engineer with us tonight that'll speak to some of those issues. The site plan has been redesigned for the right in, right out to further --

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: It's restricted left

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

out.

ROSS APPEL: Restricted left out. I'm sorry. Please listen to them when they talk about these technical details. They know them better than me.

But the bottom line is, we have taken traffic into very serious consideration. I told everybody here today, leave the office early. You never know what you're going to get on Folly Road. We understand it's a serious issue. Believe it or not, a car wash is not a traffic generating use compared to things like office, residential, things of that nature. And I'll let our experts talk more about that.

But the bottom line is, once you've heard all the testimony today, you've reviewed all of the expert opinions and reports and letters and analyses that we've presented, I think you'll reach the conclusion that vehicular traffic and pedestrian connectivity are -- are not problems in this situation.

One -- one thing I want to mention about conditions, staff has -- has proposed a sweet of conditions for you all to consider. We're fine with all of them. Great. We want to do a good development

for this property. We're -- we've received feedback since day one. We've received feedback at the community meeting. We received feedback from staff. We have incorporated all of that into the current design that we've proceeded with tonight, which has made the plan better than it was on day one. And we will continue to do that by virtue of accepting these conditions with an open mind and frankly a willingness to -- to proceed.

So to sum up, legally, it's extremely important that the board -- and I sat on the BZA, and I tell my colleagues this all the time. It is extremely important to focus on the scope of review because that's what get boards in trouble. That's what gets John Dewberry reversing us on appeal for the City of Charleston when we stray out of our lane, and it's very important to stay in the lane with BZA.

So, number one, just to sum up, we shouldn't be here. We don't require a special exception. If you think a special exception is required under the overlay. It's restricted to pedestrian issues, planned streetscapes and architecture, which, frankly, all three of those issues are addressed.

And as a third remote backup, if we have to

young people, high school/college kids that we teach

40 how to work. We teach them how to serve. 1 We teach them how to show up on time and be in uniform. 2 3 teach them things that they don't learn in school. give them scholarships so that they can go to college 4 and university. We care about them and we care about 5 the communities that we operate in, and it's very 6 important to me that we do the right kind of 7 development. Many of you are new to this. You 8 haven't seen the presentation that I made on April the 3rd. We asked as many people in the community to come 10 and hear what we were about as a company and what 11 12 we're trying to do at this very special site on James 13 Island. 14 We're trying to get it to pull up now. Because I want to go through that, because I think 15 it's important. We're not here -- although, we do 16 monitor the social media and we do monitor some of the 17 things that have been put out there. Some true. 18 19 not true. Some blatantly false. 20 And so I want to have the opportunity tonight, and I appreciate you guys allowing us to 21

speak because I think it's important that we put in the record some of these facts as we get the PowerPoint to go up.

Some of you may have visited a site that we

22

23

24

have on Dorchester Road right near the airport. 1 That site we bought from another operator. It doesn't have 2 the latest equipment. It is not our building. 3 a building that was built by someone else. 4 It is a great location, as far as where it's situated, but 5 other than that, it's not the way I would have 6 designed that site. So, you know, I just want to be 7 clear, if you have been to that site, what we plan do 8 9 here is going to be different. It's going to have 10 different equipment. It's going to have sound-situated equipment, going to have the latest 11 12 technology and recycling, which that site doesn't 13 have 14 We've got experts here tonight that will 15 speak about our storm water control. They will speak about the equipment that we use to recycle our wash 16 water. Our systems are designed in short to capture 17 all of the water that we use in the car wash process, 18 so all of it drains to specific filtering systems that 19 filter that water, and believe it or not, I've 20 actually drank that water. It is that clean. 21 22 So without further ado, I'm going to jump 23 into this

Do you got a clicker handy? Thank you.

I'm going to go as fast as I can. I know

24

42 1 you don't have a lot of time. 2 That is our very, very first car wash in 1969. I am a third-generation family businessperson. 3 4 Okay. Can I -- can I spin around in circles and address everybody? 5 6 All right. So I'm a third-generation family business guy. My family started with one car 7 8 Literally, they built it. My grandfather was a wash. 9 contractor. He was an electrician. They built it with their own hands, and they built one car wash at a 10 time for many years. I grew up in the business. 11 started in this business when I was 12 years old. 12 13 So what we want to do is improve this site. In short, I'm going to talk -- can you hear me, if I 14 15 talk like this? 16 All right. Because I want to go and I want to point. I've always been called a loud mouth 17 18 anyway. So I think I can do this. 19 So this is a 35-foot critical buffer line. 20 In current condition, there is a building that exists inside this 35-foot critical buffer line. In fact, 21 the building, as it sits today, is 6.63 feet from the 22 23 D Hec (phonetic) OCRM critical line, which I think is like pretty close to the water. I don't know -- I 24

25

don't know what all that means, but it's pretty dang

creek.

24

25

and it goes -- it drains. She flows directly into the

And, you know, there's currently an existing structure there, 6.3 feet away from the OCRM line. And that's actually an error. It's OCRM.

So there's a current structure that's there. We're going to remove that. We're going to rehabilitate this whole area and there's going to be a buffer. We're going to abide by the landscape requirements. We're going to get a wetland scientist, and we're going to go out there and rehabilitate to his direction.

Currently, there's nothing to this. All that water is flowing directly into the creek including the creek.

So if we can flip to the next slide, the proposed conditions. As Carl mentioned, what we're going to be doing is, here is the 35-foot buffer we're rehabilitating. That's currently not there. All that water, that's currently just draining directly in the creek, and it's picking up oil and all kinds of things off of gravel and going straight in the creek. We're going to put a curb right there. We're going to have underground catch basins, storm drainage that's going to -- they'll be the tension that actually detains it also, and we're going to direct it to the water quality structure.

And what that water quality structure does it actually cleanses the storm water. So instead of everything draining directly into the creek, we're picking up an underground storm piping that's going to be detained. That's going to be sent to a water quality structure, which filters all the sediment. Once it goes through that water quality structure, then it goes to the public system, which is on the road, and then it's drained into the creek. That is -- I don't know of any other developments in the area that have something like that. That's going to be much improved over -- definitely the existing conditions but also really any other properties that's out there that I know of.

You know, for example, the gas station across the street, they have underground storm drainage, but the storm water goes directly into that, and all the pavement, all the oil that's spilled on that, it drains directly in the storm drainage. Then there's a pipe that goes directly in the creek. So that is a terrible situation. The existing condition is frankly a terrible situation. What we're doing is much, much better. That addresses the storm waters. That's any water that falls onto the pavement from rain.

Also what we're doing, the water that's used for the car wash is reclaimed. There are big reclamation systems underground. All that water is going to go into those tanks, and 80 percent of it -- 80 to 90 percent of it is recycled.

CARL HOWARD: We can get down to five gallons a car of fresh water to wash a car with that system.

MICHAEL MCDONALD: Now, you say, you know, there's five percent or 10 percent or whatever that's reused, that water does not go into that storm drainage system. It goes into the sanitary sewer system so then it goes to the waste water treatment plants. So, I mean, there's almost not a drop of water that goes on our site that's not cleansed that goes into that creek. That is a huge improvement over the existing conditions and --

CARL HOWARD: He's an engineer. I'm not. So I needed his help. So for -- for one minute, what I want to talk about is a driveway car wash. So when you wash your car in your driveway, whatever you use to wash your car with goes onto the hard surface unless you wash it on the grass or somewhere in your yard. That's actually the safest way to home wash your car, but if you wash your car on a paved surface,

whether it flows in the storm drain or not, it'll dry 1 on that surface. If it does not and the next time it 2 rains, the rainwater will pick up those soaps and it 3 will go to the storm drainage eventually which then, 4 in fact, it will go into the creek, not only are we a 5 solution to help this site be better and more 6 environmentally friendly, we're a solution for all of 7 James Island for anyone that thinks about washing 8 their car on a surface, on a hard surface. 9 It's much safer to take it to a car wash that captures that waste water and dispose of it properly.

Talk about treating runoff. That's an example of the system that we plan to use to treat the storm water. This is just a marketing piece about -and yeah, we use very little water.

Flipping through.

All right. Let's talk about the grand oak tree. This is a picture. It's a little bit hard to see because there's lighting in here, but underneath one of the branches of that tree there have been trucks that travel under that tree and have scraped the bark off of one of the branches. We plan to improve the condition of the tree. One, by taking care of that branch that at some point will die, and our arborist will -- in fact will talk about the tree

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

and how we're exactly going to treat it, but that's one of the things that we'll be able to do. But, yes, we are asking to pave under it a little bit beyond -- and we'll talk about that later, the -- the variance that we're going to try and do, but what we're going to do under that tree is have pervious pavement.

so that's the current condition of the tree now. As you can see, there's a driveway that's four and a half feet from the trunk of that tree from the 60-inch line. There is another driveway 13 feet on the other side, and then we don't have the dimension on there, but it's only a few feet that a car could actually park right beside the tree on the gravel.

In our proposed development, we plan to protect the base of the tree so that no vehicle is going to get any closer than 11 feet to the base of that tree, and, again, all of the paving that would be done under the drip line of that tree would be pervious, so it can actually get the rainwater that falls under the drip line.

This is a picture of the current tree on the left, and then the tree as we would prune it and improve it on the right. So as you can see, there is one branch that's damaged that we propose to take out. Just barely see it here. And then in this picture it

would have been right there; okay?

So here's our site plan, as we talked about. That 35-foot buffer will be landscaped and improved. The tree condition will be improved.

Again, I got to go and point, so I'll talk really loud about the flow a little bit.

This was before we came out with the limited right out. So that driveway is going to change a little bit and have a right out only, full access in. Ours will stack this end of the car wash. We are a full service, so we back in the cars, but we are actually backing them on the conveyor as they move. As part of the process to gain efficiencies in our business, we're all about time and motion and procedurally driven. So we can process the car at the entrance in with one person in two minutes with two people backing in the car in actually 45 seconds, which is about the pace that our conveyor runs. As it goes through that process, it takes about two minutes to go through the entire car wash process. During that process, the exterior of the car is clean and dried. When it comes out, we'll have two-man teams because of the size of this site -- it's not a big site for us, so we'll have two-man teams or two-person teams, as the case may be, and we will be able to wipe

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

the car down inside and out in about two, two and a half minutes depending on if they get an extra service or not. Standard service, a car can be wiped down by two of our employees in two minutes, so we can easily turn over a full service car in 15 minutes or less.

And the reason I say this to be true, we secret shop every one of our car washes three times a month and part of -- part of a manager's bonus is contingent on them scoring well and meeting that time standard, so they're very keen on training their people to meet that time standard.

Some examples of our architecture that we've done. We went quickly through the standard building. We don't propose to do that, and granted, I think we said before this is not an architectural decision night, but we do want to show you a couple of examples. This is an example of a site in Norfolk, Virginia, with a little more commuted and a smaller tower. This is an example of a rezoned site that we did in an area of Charlotte, near South Park. It's a very fluent area, and we had to get it rezoned so we did some different things, different architecture.

This is examples of different architecture that we're happy to do, and we want to work with the town, and we want to work with the neighbors to -- to

1	create something that is appealing and that everybody 51
2	would like.
3	There's another example. I call it kind of
4	a low country look. It's got kind of a front porch
5	appeal to it and a hit roof, standing seam. So in
6	brief, it might have sounded a long time, but that's
7	basically what we covered in our meeting on April the
8	3rd. I appreciate your attention to it, and I'm
9	available for questions. Thank you very much.
10	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you so much.
11	Is there anyone else who's going to speak?
12	This is where you all will wrap up your presentation.
13	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I think we want to call
14	Donny Skinner, our arborist, and we actually we
15	engaged two arborists. I'm sorry, we engaged two
16	arborists. Donny Skinner being one, and the board has
17	both letters that were written. They both found that
18	the tree will be in better shape, a healthier shape,
19	after our development than it's currently in, and
20	Donny can speak to that. You guys do have the letters
21	and just I'll let Donny speak a little further.
22	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you.
23	DONNY SKINNER: I'm Donny Skinner. I'm a
24	certified arborist and a registered forester with the
25	State of South Carolina. I am a resident of James

```
Island, but what I want to start off with, if I can, I
  1
  2
     got two things over here, but I don't have the slides.
  3
                 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Donny, I can pull it up
  4
    here.
  5
                 DONNY SKINNER: Okay. Can everybody hear
  6
    me?
 7
                UNIDENTIFIED MALE:
                                     No.
 8
                DONNY SKINNER: What we've got -- we've
 9
    got -- right now?
10
                UNIDENTIFIED MALE:
                                    Yeah.
11
                DONNY SKINNER: What we've got right now --
    and I've been on the site numerous days taking a look
12
13
    at the tree. This is our existing conditions.
    the way around the tree from years of seafood shopping
14
15
    and SnoBall shopping, the soil and gravel is
    compacted. Very little air is getting to the root
16
    system. Not good for the tree.
17
18
                We've got the one limb that they addressed
    earlier that has been beat up by trucks. What we
19
20
    propose to do in our new treatment -- this is the limb
    that's been beat up for years and years. It's gouged
21
    out. It's about five percent of the canopy. So what
22
    we would be doing is reducing about five percent of
23
    the canopy. ANSII standard, 835 standards for tree
24
25
    care for pruning, we cannot prune any more than
```

25 percent of foliage in one year. We'll be pruning maybe five percent.

In addition to that, we're going to be removing and paving the pavement and the gravel. So all this four and a half feet, all this is going to be drawn back. Because this is a new — this is going to be the new area around your tree. In that area, once the gravel and pavement is removed, we're going to aerate. Aeration is taking an auger, drilling down every three feet, a three-feet grid that helps get oxygen back in the soil.

In addition to the aeration, we're going to apply treatment of fertilizer. That fertilizer gives us immediate nutrient availability to the tree. In our fertilizer, we also include a mycorrhizal.

Mycorrhizal is a fungus that helps to absorb nutrients. So that's a benefit.

Once we get that done, we're going to apply a three-inch layer of mulch, wood mulch, over the entire root system. Wood mulch will, in time, break down, provide nutrients. It also helps in the heat of our summers protecting the root system. It holds moisture. Keeps the root system from drying out. That is the treatments we're going to do on the ground. There's also the pruning in addition to the

I'm not sure if we have that -- it's actually -- for

```
1
     those that want to see it, it's actually showing on
     that board over there, but there's -- it limits a left
  2
  3
     turn out of the site.
  4
                 CHAIRWOMAN LYON:
                                   Thank you.
  5
                 JENNIFER BIHL: Hi.
                                      I'm -- hi.
    Jennifer Bihl with Bihl Engineering. I'm a traffic
  6
 7
    engineer in Charleston.
 8
                UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: We can't hear, I'm
 9
    sorry.
10
                UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Much louder, please.
11
                JENNIFER BIHL: Is that better?
12
                UNIDENTIFIED MALE:
                                     Okav.
13
                JENNIFER BIHL: We'll get right on the mic
14
    today.
                I'm Jennifer Bihl with Bihl Engineering.
15
    We're a traffic engineering firm in Charleston, South
16
    Carolina. We did the trip generation study of what
17
    type of trips would be expected for this type of
18
    development based on industry standards.
19
    Institute of Transportation Engineers provides trip
20
21
    generation characteristics of a myriad of uses that
22
    you guys probably have seen before from other
    presentations, but, you know, an automated car wash is
23
24
    one of the uses, and so you look at the peak hour,
25
    which is your afternoon of the commute time.
```

that's one hour between 4:00 and 6:00 and then we also — because of the type of use of being an automated car wash, we also looked at Saturday. And so this is a peak hour on as well to be able to see what the type of trips that we would expect for this type of use, and so the afternoon peak hours — this is one hour between 4:00 and 6:00 p.m. on your average weekday, so that's a Tuesday, Wednesday, Thursday. This is expected to have 18 entering trips and 17 exiting trips, and so — which is — you would expect, this looks over the hours. Anybody coming in would be coming out versus a land use that people would stay for, you know, an extended period of time. And you guys have this in a memo — a memorandum in your package.

For the Saturday peak hour, we would expect a little bit more higher use, and this is just one hour on a Saturday. It doesn't give a time of day. We would expect about 37 trips in and about 37 trips out, and so that's what they consider, and this is based on — it's international organization. It's based on empirical data that's been collected across the country and, you know, comparatively, we have opportunities for fast food, which would obviously be a much higher generator than the car wash would be or

are what we call a water restoration system in the car wash industry, the vehicle wash industry.

3 Autobell uses our system in every new car wash that they build because they're sole environmentally friendly. They want the state of the art in waste water treatment so that they can reuse the water they see from that standpoint, but they also want to be environmentally friendly at the same time. What our system does that's different than anybody else's system in the use in the car wash industry is we actually remove the chemicals from the used water. Everybody else, they call them reclaim systems or reclaimed systems. You sell out solids. reclaim system in settling tanks. Water comes out of the car wash, goes into settling tanks. That's where the oils are separated out. That's where the dirt is separated out, and then we -- it goes into our first chamber we call an aeration chamber, and in that aeration chamber, we aerate the water. What we're trying to do is increase the dissolved oxygen level in the water. By doing that, the bacteria that are propagated in that environment are called aerobic bacteria. Aerobic bacteria are 90 percent more aggressive in consuming waste out of the water in the bacteria. An example, a septic system in the olden

1

2

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

days, not so much today, but in the olden days the 1 bacteria that grew in the water was anaerobic Anaerobic bacteria don't like oxygen in the 3 bacteria. water.

So by aerating the water, we do two things: One, we propagate aerobic bacteria, and the second thing is that we have bacteria that is more aggressive in consuming the waste out of the water.

So we're the only ones that do that in this industry. And that's done in our bio chamber here where we actually have plastic media inside of there just like we do in sewer treatment plants do in your environment here. We treat the water exactly the same way. We separate out solids. They aerate the water. We aerate the water, and then they have a bio chamber where they have active bacteria that consumes the human waste out of the water. In our case, we're consuming the chemical waste out of the water; okay?

Now, the other fact that's very important when you're looking at waste water treatment is that the chemicals have got to be readily biodegradable. We can have readily biodegradable chemistry. You can have slow biodegrade chemistry, and you can have chemistry that won't biodegrade. What we use in the Autobell sites -- I do a complete analysis of the

2

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

61 1 they would be able to hear me. 2 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: We need to pick it up for 3 the tape. 4 FRANCES SIMMONS: For the tape. Thank you. 5 GEORGE SHIELD: First off, I would like to 6 say thank you to the board members and -- and staff for all of your consideration of this project, which 7 8 is a petition by our company, Pavilion Development. 9 We've worked lots of hours with staff on this and really appreciate them being very forthcoming with 10 11 suggestions, with technical matters. Everything that we would need to consider in order to make this 12 particular development something that meets the 13 14 standards for approval. So thank you very much for 15 that. 16 I'd also like to say thank you to the community. I see many faces here that -- that showed 17 up at the impromptu or I should say voluntary meeting 18 that we had over at the hotel recently to share the 19 20 concerns that they had over the development, and while those may not be necessarily germane to the decisions 21 that you're making tonight, they matter to us because 22 23 these are our customers. 24 As it says in the comprehensive plan, 25 commercial corridor zoning is to promote the

1 development of uses that people on the island need and 2 will use without having to go off the island to get 3 That's what the comprehensive plan has said 4 since the very first draft. I read them all. that is exactly why we're here and -- and it is -- and 5 6 it is these people and their neighbors, your 7 neighbors, that -- that we -- that's part of our 8 business is to work with all of them. We're -nobody's going to drive their car from Charleston over 9 10 here to get a car wash. The car wash is your car 11 That tree is your tree. This site is in your 12 community. And we have really appreciated all of the 13 feedback that we have gotten. Much of it is based on a lack of understanding of the technical matters that 14 15 relate to the car wash, the technical matters that relate to the storm water, the technical matters that 16 17 relate to the tree, and we have tried to address all 18 of those concerns that we've heard from the 19 neighborhood by bringing in people that are not lay 20 people but that are experts in authorities on those 21 things that matter to the community. Again, that may 22 not be part of what you all are here and the findings 23 that are incumbent on you to find, but it does matter 24 to us.

One thing I would also like to point out is

63 Pavilion Development is a multigenerational family 1 2 development company. We have been stakeholders in the Charleston area for many, many years. My family --3 I'm actually operating a tree farm that our family has 4 5 owned for 60 years. We are developing real estate in places where my family has lived since the 1600s. want to do the right thing. That's why we're here. That's why we -- we bring in the experts because we really endeavor to do the right thing because we are long-term stakeholders in every community where we build a store or a piece of real estate, and we will continue to be.

I'd just like to sort of summarize this by going back to the very basics. Throughout this process, if you look at the technical matters and the facts, this property is zoned for this use. Your neighbors, your taxpayers that we're buying this property from invested in this property and ran businesses there because it was a commercial piece of property that someday when they were ready to retire could be part of their retirement. Those are your neighbors. That's who we're buying this property This use is permitted under the zoning. from. in keeping with the comprehensive plan, which calls for uses like this at that property, and we have

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

	April 18, 201
1	At this time I would like to ask, are there
2	any questions for the applicant or any of their
3	experts from any members of the board? I'm sure we
4	all have a lot of good questions.
5	Jim, would you like to jump in first?
6	JIM FRALIX: I'd like to comment on the
7	last gentleman. He said he's the only one that talks
8	about the public, and I thought it was a very good
9	addition to the overall you know, consolidation,
10	and the first guy was just telling us that we should
11	not even exist.
12	UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Here, here.
13	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yeah.
14	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Come on, guys. You'll
15	all get to talk.
16	JIM FRALIX: I don't mean to be funny, but
17	the last man talked about the public. We have to
18	concern ourselves with the public. I mean, we're the
19	BZA, but we still have a concern about what the public
20	thinks about these projects. And you've given a very
21	good presentation in my judgment. Doesn't mean I'm
22	going to vote for it, but so I just wanted to add

CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Sim, did you have any questions? Mr. Parrish?

that.

23

24

	April 18, 20
1	even whatever we need to do to clear the
2	communication lines, we can do it. It would still
3	keep us below 25 percent pruning at an annual growing
4	year. So, I mean, you know, that is well within what
5	we can and we'll do for the health of the tree if we
6	need to.
7	SIM PARRISH: Okay. My next question
8	this is in reference to the traffic going in and out
9	of the unit.
10	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Ms. Bihl, can you come
11	SIM PARRISH: Okay. That's good right
12	there.
13	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Oh.
14	SIM PARRISH: At the northern end of your
15	property, you have a it's on the plan, it says
16	it's a painted line that extends into the parking lot
17	of the finance company there. What are you what's
18	going to stop individuals from coming in and exiting
19	out that, that property there that's private
20	property. And how are you going to stop people from
21	coming in and out of there? I know you put in your
22	exiting only going to the right only but that up there
23	allows people to enter and exit into the traffic.
24	CARL HOWARD: So in so in talking to our

CARL HOWARD: So in -- so in talking to our neighbor with the powers at be in that company, they

would actually prefer a stronger traffic control

measure. So in discussions with them, we would put

some kind of curbing in that the town would be

amenable to, and I would prefer a roll type curb as

opposed to a hard curb because our customers sometimes

don't pay attention even though we'll put -- we'll put

plastic so it's clear that there's a barrier there,

but we'll put some kind of physical barrier between

the two properties.

SIM PARRISH: Okay.

ROSS APPEL: And I'm sorry, just to elaborate on that, all that will be addressed also in the site planning and the engineering design and the review of the town and, you know, we'll work with the DOT and the town's recommendations to come up with something that works with everybody.

is, you note -- you stated that the maximum number of -- maximum time a car could be in this place is 15 minutes from start to finish. That's with the premium package. What is the minimum amount of time that an individual car could be in your service?

CARL HOWARD: So we have a basic service that we call a ride through where the customer stays in the car and they do not get out of the car and we

1	do not wipe it down and that car will, from the time
2	it enters our driveway until the time it leaves our
3	driveway, could be anywhere from depending on the
4	line, three minutes to six minutes.
5	SIM PARRISH: Based on your current
6	location in north Charleston, do you have an idea of
7	how many cars during your peak time that you service,
8	say, in an hour?
9	CARL HOWARD: It's about the same as the
10	traffic engineer. There's more traffic it's a
11	four-lane divided highway there, so there's a bit more
12	traffic on Dorchester Road at that point, I believe,
13	than there's on Folly Road, but that store is maxed
14	out right now at about 40 in one hour on a busy
15	Saturday going downhill.
16	SIM PARRISH: That's all I have. Thank
17	you.
18	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Mr. Parrish.
19	Mr. Gregorie, do you have any questions
20	you'd like to ask at this time?
21	JASON GREGORIE: I guess I do. I had I
22	wanted to understand the operations again in vehicles
23	per hour. So and when you said, I guess, 40 per
24	hour, I mean, is that your maximum? Is that your
25	average? I'm trying to get a handle of how many cars

we will see cued up at this site at any one time.

CARL HOWARD: So without getting too

technical on car wash development, we have our -- that South Park site that I had up there with the little fancy architecture is on a corner lot in Charlotte, two main thoroughfares. One called Tibola (phonetic); the other, Park Road. It's an area that is high intensity retail, high intensity office and high in residential. It's one of our top five volume car washes in the country, and we only have 12 stack going into that site. We don't anticipate this site to be -- it might be half of what that site is. Maybe a

JASON GREGORIE: Well, what would be your operation plan if you have a car stack and vehicles can't turn into your site from Folly Road? Do you have a plan where you'll gate off your site? I mean, is -- what would you do from an operation standpoint to prevent vehicles from stacking on the Folly Road?

CARL HOWARD: We would have to assign someone to send them down the road. Again, I will tell you that based on my experience in my own company, this site has very adequate stacking. We work with staff. We feel like we can move the driveway slightly south and add two more spaces. That

little bit more.

1	would be 10 spaces and again our ter since 1
_	would be 10 spaces, and, again, our top five car wash
2	in Charlotte has 12, and they never back out into the
3	street. So we feel like that will be more than
4	adequate if we have two more stack.
5	JASON GREGORIE: Okay. Thank you.
6	SIM PARRISH: I had one more question. I
7	apologize.
8	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Go ahead, Mr. Parrish.
9	SIM PARRISH: The only other question I had
10	about that I forgot. I'm sorry about that. What
11	are your hours of operation?
12	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Our standard of hours
13	in the summer are 7:00 a.m. to 8:00 p.m.
14	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Mr. Smith.
15	ROY SMITH: I've looked at your site plan
16	and you have 18 spaces, but you've just been talking
17	about adding two more. How many spaces do you need?
18	How many parking
19	CARL HOWARD: Are you talking about stack
20	or are you talking about car parking spaces? Are you
21	talking about exit in room for cars?
22	ROY SMITH: Car sparking spaces on the
23	site.
24	CARL HOWARD: We'll meet the town ordinance
25	as far as parking spaces parking requirements. What

1	Jason and I were discussing were the stack into the
2	car wash, I believe.
3	ROY SMITH: My question is, how many car
4	spaces car parking spaces do you need?
5	MICHAEL MCDONALD: I think if we go to the
6	site plan there, I think when you say the 18 spaces,
7	that was on the original plan, and I think there may
8	have been an error where the new plan, where we are
9	acquiring the TitleMax property. We didn't make the
10	change to change it to 18 spaces to Autobell property
11	or the Huff property. Once we made that change, I
12	think we went to and I don't have the number in
13	front of me. I think there's 28 spaces, but they're
14	depicted on that plan right there, but that's to serve
15	the TitleMax property and also the Autobell, the Huff
16	property.
17	ROY SMITH: So if I'm understanding, you
18	have a line that's painted that says, do not cross,
19	and everything on your side of that line is for this
20	Autobell.
21	MICHAEL MCDONALD: Yes, sir.
22	ROY SMITH: And everything that's across
23	that painted line is for TitleMax.
24	MICHAEL MCDONALD: Yes, sir.
25	ROY SMITH: So I see that for TitleMax

1	I'm not counting those spaces.
2	MICHAEL MCDONALD: Right.
3	ROY SMITH: How many do you have that you
4	can utilize for your property and how many do you
5	need?
6	MICHAEL MCDONALD: I don't have that exact
7	count. Let me walk over here and show you.
8	ROY SMITH: Well, why would you just
9	tell me how you would derive on how many you need.
10	MICHAEL MCDONALD: There are actually more
11	parking spots that we're showing than what we need,
12	and the reason that we're showing those parking spots
13	is so that we meet the town code. There is a minimum
14	amount of parking spots that the town code is going to
15	require, so we have to show that many spots.
16	ROY SMITH: And what is that what is
17	that number based on?
18	MICHAEL MCDONALD: It's in the town
19	ordinance. If Kristen could probably help with that,
20	but it's if you go through their guidelines and
21	their code, it's based on use.
22	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: This would be two from
23	(inaudible) on shift.
24	ROY SMITH: Two per employee on shift.
25	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Uh-huh.

1	MICHAEL MCDONALD: And what we've done is
2	meet what the town is requiring in terms of parking
3	spots. Now, technically, we don't need that many, but
4	because they're requiring it, we have shown that on
5	the plan.
6	ROY SMITH: How many employees will you
7	have at any given time?
8	CARL HOWARD: Our average shift would
9	probably have about five employees at this site.
10	Based on our pro forma, it could go slightly up or
11	slightly down. Certainly, weather has an impact on
12	the number of employees at any given day. On a busy
13	day where we're approaching that 40-car mark, we would
14	need about 12 employees total.
15	ROY SMITH: If you need two spaces per
16	employee and they have 12 employees, then they would
17	need 24 spaces; is that correct? Did I get that math
18	correct?
19	CARL HOWARD: I think I think she just
20	quoted a statistic incorrectly. I don't think one
21	employee is going to drive two cars. I think what she
22	means is that there's two there's a one space
23	for every two employees; is that correct?
24	JENNIFER BIHL: You would need two parking
25	spots per employee for two.

```
1
                 ROY SMITH: So, Ms. Crane, the rule is two
 2
    parking spaces per employee?
 3
                 KRISTEN CRANE:
                                 Right.
 4
                ROY SMITH: I just heard that we'll have up
 5
    to 12 employees --
 6
                JENNIFER BIHL: I would --
 7
                ROY SMITH: -- at one time, so that is 24
 8
    because two times 12 is 24 --
 9
                JENNIFER BIHL: Right.
10
                ROY SMITH: -- right? Okay. Just let me
11
    look. I see 18 on the plan that I've been given.
12
                ROSS APPEL: Yeah, I'm sorry. What I was
13
    going to say is, we are sharing with the TitleMax
    property, and I believe that their requirement is
14
    three spots, so it's -- and, you know, I'm not sure of
15
16
    the calculation, but if we need to provide more
17
    parking spots, we can. From the operations, we don't
    need them, but we will during the site planning
18
19
    process -- we won't increase the size of the paved
20
    area. We'll do it on there, but we will meet the
21
    code, and we'll do that through the site plan process.
22
                ROY SMITH: So what I'm understanding
    this -- that plan isn't maybe not what you're going to
23
24
    end up doing?
25
                                They're acquiring the
                JENNIFER BIHL:
```

1	TitleMax, so we'll do a shared parking agreement is
2	I think what
3	ROSS APPEL: That's right.
4	ROY SMITH: And TitleMax, how many parking
5	spaces do they need to have?
6	JENNIFER BIHL: They will need to have one
7	per 300 square feet of floor area, which doesn't count
8	for storage, you know, restrooms.
9	ROY SMITH: So that's five parking spaces.
10	JENNIFER BIHL: That's five yeah,
11	probably four, but.
12	ROY SMITH: It's just floor area. It
13	doesn't count for restrooms and stuff like that.
14	JENNIFER BIHL: So they would be four, you
15	know, 28 all together.
16	ROY SMITH: We exceed the code; is that
17	is that correct?
18	ROSS APPEL: So let me see if I can cut to
19	the chase here a little bit.
20	ROY SMITH: Stop. Let me count. Okay.
21	ROSS APPEL: We are not here for a parking
22	variance. The site plan that you see right there
23	meets the code. That's not my opinion. That's
24	Kristen's opinion. That's why we're here. That's why
25	staff has not required us to get a parking variance.

1	The parking issue is not the issue. We've met the
2	code, period. I'll let's just put an exclamation
3	on that fact.
4	ROY SMITH: Well, I need to understand it.
5	Because this, you know, you have a line that says,
6	don't cross, and it just gets my attention, and we've
7	been asking about it, and then I understand that there
8	might not be a line, that actually it might be a curb
9	and you might get two more spaces because you want to
10	move the entry south. So I'm just not comfortable
11	that what we're looking at is what we're actually
12	approving.
13	ROSS APPEL: We've worked with Kristen for
14	months. That's before you today, the revised plan.
15	That's in your packet. It's before the board. It
16	meets all of the parking requirements:
17	ROY SMITH: Okay.
18	ROSS APPEL: It's not my opinion. It's
19	Kristen's. We're not here for a parking variance. We
20	meet all the code requirements, and there's no
21	question to that fact.
22	CARL HOWARD: There was a proffer there
23	was a proffer that we've agreed to that we would work
24	with staff regarding their opinion of stack and
25	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Excuse me. Can everyone

please be quiet in the background? You'll all get your turn to talk. I promise. Thank you.

CARL HOWARD: Kristen asked us to work with her and make everybody feel good about our number of stack going into the car wash. We draw the best concept of what we think -- of what we feel very confident will work, but if there's more staff input or BZA input or -- or neighbor input, we're happy to work with them to alter the plan to make everybody happy, and so that's what that plan is about.

ROY SMITH: Thank you.

CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Mr. Smith.

And I appreciate the questions on parking because I think what I'm hearing from the board is, you know, a concern if it becomes busy and there's a lack of spaces and then it backs out into Folly Road, and that's a concern that I have as well.

My question for you all is regarding what sort of noise, vibration, light, pollution, anything like that can we expect from this type of operation, if it's not like the one up on Dorchester Road. I haven't been to any of the ones in Charlotte. I'm just curious on that because most car washes that, you know, I've been through, you know, have noise and light and can be disturbing. The other car washes in

80 1 vibrate or -- okay. 2 CARL HOWARD: Vibration causes wear, and we're very keen on maintenance and things like that. 3 So, no, it doesn't vibrate. 4 5 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you. 6 Are there any other questions from any other board members? Is there anyone else present who 7 8 wishes to speak in support of this request? We'll start with the gentleman here, and if you'll please 9 10 come up, state your name and address and -- and please speak into the mic, so Ms. Simmons can hear and so can 11 12 the tape. 13 CHASE HOWARD: My physical address? Like 14 where I live? Like where I'm from? 15 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Yes, sir. 16 CHASE HOWARD: I'm Chase Howard. I'm from 17 Charlotte, South Carolina, and I'm speaking in favor of the Autobell car wash. I'm a recent Clemson 18 19 University grad, and I worked at Autobell as a teenager from the time I was 16 all the way up until I 20 21 was 21 years old, and I can tell you the firsthand -like, firsthand, the positive impacts that Autobell 22 had on the surrounding community whether it be from 23 24 local creek cleanups to scholarship programs.

25

Autobell really made a difference in my hometown

1 growing up. My friends and I learned the values of 2 service, respect and hard work while making great 3 money. I truly believe that Autobell would be a great addition to the James Island community. Finally, I 4 ask the BZA consider this case solely on facts and not 5 6 on baseless emotions. 7 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you so much, Mr. 8 Howard. 9 Is there anyone else wishing to speak for 10 the applicant? Yes, sir. 11 CHRIS ORMAN: Hi. Good evening. My name is Chris Orman. I'm with Pavilion. I live here in 12 13 town at 1220 Cedar Street on James Island and just 14 summing up everything that these folks have said, you know, I do live here in town. I want something that 15 16 this community that I live in and would be a part of. 17 You know, something that I would be proud of to say to your all's other friends, family, folks here in town 18 that, you know, I did this project, I helped out on it 19 20 and that, you know, we stand behind what we do and, you know, we have other examples throughout, you know, 21 the low country in this town and, you know, fully in 22 23 support of the project and something that, you know, living here I'm proud to be a part of and hopefully it 24 25 continues.

1	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Mr. Orman.
2	Anyone else on this side of the room for?
3	Yes, sir, if you can please come up.
4	BILL HUFF: Hi. My name is Bill Huff. I'm
5	the seller.
6	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: State your address for
7	me, sir.
8	BILL HUFF: Stone Post Road. I live here.
9	I thought everybody knew me. I thought everybody knew
10	everything about me. We opened up Huff Seafood in
11	1995. We purchased the property in 1999. We built
12	the new location on there. Our family, our four sons
13	worked together in this business for 23 years, and now
14	we're ready to retire. This is the second near sale
15	we've encountered so far. We had some kickback on Lag
16	(phonetic) Factory when they wanted to buy it.
17	Basically, some of the neighbors expressed great
18	displeasure. They don't want a Lag Factory on the
19	island, and I feel like we're getting pushback that's
20	not warranted here.
21	We built a relationship with many families
22	over the years. We have supported each other, the
23	families and ourselves through good times and bad
24	through 1911 and then 2011. The 9/11. There we
25	go. And the 2008 recession. You know, we've had some

struggles making it this far. We have paid the property off. This is our retirement. We are residents. We're not the enemy.

Personally, these folks have gained my trust, these buyers. Autobell, if you ask for it, they come up with it. They listen, you know, to our concerns about the tree. You know, I don't want anybody to hurt that tree. I wanted to get an arborist some years back, but I couldn't afford one. There's some other things I would like to have done on the property I could not afford it. These people have the wherewithal to do that, and I look forward seeing their finished product. I just hope that you guys will use reasonable forethought in making your decisions, and thank you for your time.

CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Mr. Huff.

BILL HUFF: Okay.

CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Anyone else in -- wishing to speak in favor of the applicant on this side of the room? Anyone wishing to speak in favor of the applicant on this side of the room?

So I'm assuming everyone else is wishing to speak in opposition to the request, so I'll just go down the list.

If you'd still come up and state your name

and address. Carol Jackson? Is she here?

CAROL JACKSON: Good evening. Yes. My

name is Carol Jackson. I am very proud to have been

recently elected as the city council representative in

District 12 here on the island, but tonight I'm

6 representing my family. My husband and I live at 1461

7 Patterson Avenue, so we're at the end of the street

that contains the Blue Water and directly across from

9 Huffs.

I want to pay my respect to the Huffs. I know this has been a really hard season of their lives trying to find a good buyer for their property, and I personally, you know, understand their plate, but I do think that you have been given the chance tonight to do your — take your responsibilities. I think Autobell's lawyer made it clear what he thinks is your responsibility, but I would say that you should go behind door number three as he offered to you and entertain this project request under the full set of special criteria that you have in front of you that is attached to the ordinance. It's incorporated in the ordinance for the town.

And I also made a note about -- the attorney said that this is not about the location. I think it's the total opposite. When you look at a

special criteria request, you're looking at the exact 1 location that the project is being proposed for. So 2 you have every obligation to look at the location. 3 And I -- I'm very glad that more than one person has 4 gone through the criteria, but I do think that under 5 many of those you would find an answer and it is 6 contained in the zoning, the community commercial and 7 as it's briefly represented in the comprehensive plan 8 that was passed in 2015, which was after the Folly 9 10 Road Overlay that was passed by the town and also after the Rethink Folly Road master plan was put into 11 12 So this paragraph says, the community commercial future land use category is intended to 13 allow retail and service uses that serve the 14 15 residential population of the island and they do not negatively impact the surrounding community. So I 16 17 would say to you that this project as finally represented will negatively impact the surrounding 18 19 community.

I do want to plant one comment about the storm water. I think if we weren't entertaining a car wash, we wouldn't have to worry about the unique way that they recycle their water. I have no dispute with that, but I know that in the times since the Huffs built their property in the '90s, every municipality

20

21

22

23

24

I'll be very brief. I just want to say -- first of

1	ANGELA SMITH: I understand. I realize
2	there's a Charleston location. My concern is, why not
3	build that location up to their standards that their
4	Charlotte location is and what they would want the
5	James Island location to be like, instead of investing
6	in a new property. Just a concern. I think that's
7	it. I was mostly concerned about local businesses and
8	traffic. We have a lot of traffic. We don't need any
9	more traffic. Thank you.
10	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Ms. Smith.
11	Joe Qualey.
12	JOE QUALEY: Good evening. Good to see
13	everybody. My name is Joe Qualey. I know all of you
14	all. I appreciate what you've been doing.
15	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Can you state where you
16	live for the record.
17	JOE QUALEY: 740 (inaudible).
18	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Mr. Qualey.
19	JOE QUALEY: I appreciate you all what
20	you've been doing, and this is exactly what we
21	envisioned when the town was formed, and this is
22	basically the kind of development which gave us the
23	impetus to form the town. We've worked hard. I've
24	worked hard with many people in the room and many
25	other James Islanders to try to preserve the island

```
to -- to try to -- to minimize the impact of the
 1
    existing developments to try to reduce corporates, not
 2
 3
    increase corporates.
                          Those folks are very nice.
    They're very successful, and they're very slick.
 4
 5
                UNIDENTIFIED MALE:
                                    Thanks for the
 6
    compliment.
 7
                JOE QUALEY:
                             They'll be gone. They live in
    North Carolina except for the lawyer, who --
 8
 9
                UNIDENTIFIED MALE: He lives on James
10
    Island.
11
                UNIDENTIFIED MALE: He lives here.
12
                JOE QUALEY: (Inaudible); right?
13
                UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE:
                                     Uh-huh.
14
                JOE QUALEY:
                             There's a couple of things
15
    that kind of resinate about me, which was, oh, we're
16
    going to be doing you all a favor. Just trust us.
17
    We're going to make this better than before. We'll
    make it so that you all will be proud. Unfortunately,
18
19
    with all due respect, I've worked 18 years, and it
20
    really hasn't kind of come to fruition. None of the
21
    developers who do stuff on James Island and also James
    Island -- are here anymore. Long-term stakeholders
22
23
    that means -- that means we go back to North Carolina
24
   when you keep this as a moneymaking endeavor, which is
25
    fine; okay? But just not here.
```

A couple of things. I represent 28,000 people approximately between James Island and Folly Beach. Of those 28,000 people, I have yet one to come up to me and said, Joe, I want that car wash. Everybody knows what we're trying to do in Rethink Folly Road, the overlay, and this is the poster child for what we're not trying to accomplish.

Huffs because I liked the people. The people were awesome. I'd go there and get their shrimp and other seafood, but even on a Saturday, it was heavy going in and out. I would sometimes -- maybe I need to go to Slausers (phonetic) or I would go up to the grocery store because you could do it, but I always liked to go to Huffs. Unless you're from here and you travel frequently and you're steeped in what Folly Road really is, you have no idea how dangerous it is and how difficult it is on a daily basis to do anything.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Uh-huh.

JOE QUALEY: Getting in and out of Huffs without traffic is difficult. Getting in and out of Huffs when there is traffic is difficult. Having a path or sidewalk there is -- is really difficult. Nobody's going to be able to cross all the cars that are coming in and out of. It's not going to work.

	00
1	It's not going to work for you all because when people
2	are going by, you're going to have cars stacking up on
3	Folly Road or stacking up inside your business. This
4	is not going to work.
5	Traffic. Ms. Bihl, listen carefully like I
6	did, and I'm going to ask. I'm not sure she can
7	answer this. But what are the traffic counts on a
8	Saturday on Folly Road? You know what the traffic
9	count on Saturday versus Friday, a weekend, versus a
10	weekday?
11	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Excuse me. Mr. Qualey,
12	sorry. We can't ask questions back and forth.
13	JOE QUALEY: Sorry. I got it.
14	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: They can rebut later in
15	rebuttal.
16	JOE QUALEY: Ms. Bihl, listen. I've heard
17	from a whole bunch of again, with all due respect,
18	everyone comes in with traffic consultants. Ms. Bihl
19	talks about I've done my study based upon industry
20	standards. I've heard this before because I've been
21	in another presentation where she was there and we
22	pressured her. What do you mean industry standards?
23	Did you do any studies on this road? Well, we didn't
24	need to. We just we just go by, you know and I
25	assert that making decisions based on industry

1	standards that will affect us every day is a long way
2	to go. You know, what we have here unfortunately is
3	trying to trying to shoehorn in a business that by
4	some nature relies on cars into a piece of property
5	that is not well suited for this. It is in an
6	inappropriate location. It is inappropriate for Folly
7	Road. It is inappropriate for our objectives
8	envisioned of Folly Road.
- 1	

You know, Jim was talking about how -- how one got up and was talking about caring about the community. Well, if you cared about the community, our community, that they would take the plans, take their briefcases, get in their cars and go someplace else, because that's what our community wants.

CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Mr. Qualey.
Amber Allen.

AMBER ALLEN: Good evening. I live at 1441 Downwood Place. My name is Amber Allen. Good evening. And thank you for allowing me to speak. I'm a mom of two young children. I — like I said, I live here on James Island. My daughter goes to James Island Elementary. I think we all can agree that James Island is a special place. It's unique, and it's fragile and it needs to be protected. And you have a very important and difficult decision to make

.17

tonight, so I appreciate your time. I believe that just because they can put their business here doesn't mean that they should be here.

And I love a good car wash like the next person, but I go off the island to get my car washed. And I'm here today to just urge you to please deny their requests on -- for two reasons. One, I'm concerned about the possible negative impact of the This is our home. And we want to keep environment. it clean. And we know from Charleston water keeper that our waters are incredibly polluted already, and I know that accidents can and do happen even if we have the best intentions. I would love for James Island's environment to be able to bounce back so my children can enjoy it for years to come if they choose to stay here. And secondly, I'm concerned about the potential traffic increase as many of us -- many people today have already commented on. I mean, Folly Road is an incredibly dangerous road as -- which has been documented in the Post and Courier in the past couple of months. I know personally I've had way too many close calls especially around this area that the car wash wants to come into.

So, please, I ask you to be conscientious about your decision in your planning to approve or

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1	deny this business for the families that drive on this
2	road every day. More business in our community does
3	not equal a good quality of life. So thank you so
4	much.
5	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Ms. Allen.
6	Mary Edna Frazier.
7	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Jeff? Are you leaving?
8	MARY EDNA FRAZIER: Thank you for your
9	time, and thank you, first of all, for keeping 400
10	animals kenneled off of our creek. My name is Mary
11	Edna Frazier. I live across directly across from
12	Huffs Seafood on the creek, 1723 Oak Point Road.
13	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you.
14	MARY EDNA FRAZIER: And what I'd like to
15	talk about is mainly safety and that's coming in and
16	off the road on Folly. Already it is a disaster for
17	everyone who lives in our vicinity, and I think adding
18	this number of cars is going to be terribly
19	detrimental. As a pedestrian, I think also that
20	having more cars coming in and out is going to be
21	terrible. I'm a biker, and I think it's going to be
22	just difficult for everyone who lives in this
23	community. Also, I think there will be noise
24	pollution. Noise travels on a creek, and there have
25	been some issues with noise that this particular

company has had lawsuits concerning noise where it sounds like a trumpet.

I also would like to talk about the fact that our creek is the dirtiest in South Carolina already. And that's when the Charleston water keeper started looking at creeks on our creek because people get sick if they swim in our creek. You get a sore throat. You get ear aches. By bringing more pollution to our creek, we will get that runoff.

It's in a flood zone. We flood. Our creek floods. We see the water go way, way over the marsh all the time. It's going to go in their parking lot. A little drain is not going to contain it. It's not going to take care of it. The fact that they want to dig so far into the earth to put their special

dig so far into the earth to put their special containers to make it drinkable, that's going to destroy the grand tree. We don't have many beautiful spaces left, and I would just like to tell you that I hope you have the power that you're given to take care of your constituents.

CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Ms. Frazier. John Sperry.

JOHN SPERRY: I live with her. Very happily. I'm John Sperry, 1723 Oak Point Road. And I've been living on James Island for 40 years, so I've

1 Thank you all for your time, and I didn't 2 realize that you all got talked down to so much. Thank you all. 3 4 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Dr. Sperry. 5 Susan Milikan. 6 SUSAN MILIKAN: Good evening. My name is Susan Milikan. 7 I live at 762 Fort Sumter Drive. 8 live in the Town of James Island. I wish we had known 9 that we would have unlimited time this evening. I was 10 able to come up to the town on Friday and meet with 11 the planning director and review the BZA file. 12 told at that time that we would have two minutes to 13 I was told at the community meeting on speak. 14 April 3rd by the developers that they would have five 15 minutes to make their presentation and two or 16 three minutes to rebut or whatever your BZA rules were 17 that you read. So for all of us here to walk in this evening for something so unexpected, we're quite 18 19 shocked. 20 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Uh-huh. 21 SUSAN MILIKAN: It is 9:15. I would like the record to reflect it's 9:15. People have been up 22 23 here since 6:40. They have children. They have jobs. 24 I have been going to public meetings in the city and

25

county of Charleston for 15 years or more.

never seen unlimited time given, ever. So I will take my time. Thank you.

I've been able to help organize a petition that we were asked by many, many residents to put together to oppose the Autobell car wash and to ask the BZA to deny your special — the special exception variance coming before you. We had to do a little bit of legal work and go into the town's ordinance to find out what the criteria were for your special exception and for your variance. So we drafted a very specific petition that spoke to those criteria. We have been overwhelmed. That petition went public on April 4, and in 13 days it has over 1,900 signatures. I was able to give each one of you a copy of that. And I would like to give this to the attorney for Autobell right now, if I may.

Mr. Appel, the attorney, you know, was extremely specific -- in law school, we used to call it the letter of the law. Resting (phonetic) law, we called it the letter of the law, but the letter of the law is that our governments are very serious about the applications that people make, and one of the reasons I came up on Friday was to review the application file, an application for a special exception. There's a packet that's provided by the town, and I note our

staff is really, really great about letting people do 1 2 what they need to do, but a lot of interest has been 3 in this particular issue, and it was supposed to come before your -- it was supposed to come up last month 4 and many of us were watching closely that agenda. 5 It was posted that there would be a BZA meeting on 6 March 20th. On Friday, there was still no agenda for 7 8 that meeting, so we were concerned because we had 9 heard the car wash was coming. On Monday, the 19th, 10 the cases were withdrawn. So now we're here this 11 evening, on the 17th, so there's a really specific time frame and days where they have to get everything 12 13 So their application packet was due to the town 14 to be here tonight for all of us to be here legally 15 tonight, on March 20th. And Kristen was super helpful to me and we -- and, you know, she just gave me the --16 17 anyone can come up and review these things, but they 18 had to attach their letters of intent to their application for the special exception that was due on 19 March 20th to be timely for us to be here this 20 21 evening. Both of their letters of intents are dated March 29th. So I would like to have the record 22 23 reflect that their letters of intent came into the 24 town later than they made application to be here 25 timely this evening.

Thank you. I have more.

Okay. I got it.

Mr. Appel's contention and what he talked a whole about was the fact there's an underlying zoning of commercial, community commercial. We're all aware of that. What's happened in the low country is that due to our population explosion and our rising sea levels and our storms and our traffic and our evacuation concerns, municipalities have started to somewhat limit what can be built, and the Folly Road Overlay is a limitation on underlying zoning. It is legal. It has to go through all of the processes. It has to be vetted. It has to go before planning commissions.

As many of you all know, we've worked so long and hard for three or four years to convince the city of Charleston to pass the Folly Road Overlay. The town's had Folly Road Overlay for four years. It's incorporated in the town use land code and into the town ordinances. Folly Beach has it. The county has it. It's all agreed to. The Folly Road Overlay is on this land, and it's an overlay on top of the community commercial just like the cluster overlay is an overlay on top of single residential that's making a neighborhood on James Island more dense by the city

of Charleston. So these overlays act to adjust the zoning.

Your first criteria -- when you look at a special exception -- and, again, I would make the point that their application was not fully complete by the time frame needed. You are to ask, is it consistent with the recommendations contained in the town comprehensive plan and the character of the underlying zoning district purpose and intent?

Mr. Appel did not even mention the Okay. purpose and intent of either the town's comp plan or the Folly Road Overlay because he doesn't want to tell you all what it is. He wants to talk about all different kinds of other things, because this hurts his case so badly. For the town's comprehensive plan, the purpose and intent is the preservation of natural and cultural resources; okay? He didn't want to tell you all that, and that's sad. For the Folly Road Corridor Overlay -- and it says purpose and intent. The purpose and intent is to create a corridor that is welcome and attractive through the implementation of consistently use in design standards with adjacent jurisdictions and utilizing traffic safety measures and access management for vehicles and pedestrians to insure safe and efficient traffic movement.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

the purpose and intent of the zoning district per a -
per your criteria you look at; okay? It is many of

ours contention that this proposal does not meet the

first criteria.

This plan -- and I went to the Autobell car wash on Dorchester Road this morning, and I had my car washed. It will hinder and endanger traffic commuters, walkers and bicyclists. The reason why it will is because there's a number of exits and enters per hour, and I came home and I thought about it and I estimated 20 per hour. It took me about seven minutes to get through, seven or 10 minutes, so I estimated about 20 -- so you've got 20 coming in, 20 going out per hour and probably much more in the summer. these ins and outs are going to endanger people trying to walk. People trying to drive on Folly Road. going to hinder and endanger traffic. It will bring traffic to a standstill on Folly Road because the cars will have trouble entering and leaving safely. will affect the general welfare of the immediate community with all of these stopped idling cars. car wash on Dorchester Road, it looks like they can stack six waiting to go through. If people don't understand, this is like a drive-thru. It's like going to McDonald's or Chick-fil-A, just a drive-thru

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

They offer some kind of deal where you get and you pay 1 2 up front and you get a bunch of free drive-thrus. 3 it is a drive-thru. It's no different than Chick-fil-A or McDonalds, really, except for the soap 4 5 and chemicals and everything else, but the other thing is, the operation is extremely industrial. 6 I was 7 shocked by that. It's in this long hanger, and he's 8 saying it's going to be different. It's still a long 9 hanger that an SUV can fit through. It's loud. water is spewing everywhere. There will be an adverse 10 influence from the noise, the vibration, the chemical 11 12 spraying, the traffic congestion. 13 This special exception, if approved, will not allow this parcel to be developed in a way that 14 15 preserves and incorporates important natural features. 16 That is one of your all's criteria that you're looking at tonight for the special exception. That's your BZA 17 charge job to do. This does not preserve and 18 19 incorporate natural features. The creek isn't 20 incorporated into the plan. They're not 21 incorporating -- the creek isn't incorporated. They're not incorporating the tree because they're 22 23 paving right up to it within 11 feet so they can stack cars and do their jobs near it. To incorporate the 24 25 tree would be to protect its canopy and protect it's

The creek inlet will be negatively impacted 1 setback. 2 by pollutants in the air. The tree will simply be in 3 their way, which really concerns me. It's not incorporated into the plan like it might be in a 4 5 restaurant or a cafe where folks would be seated under We go so far to say that if you approve the 6 it. 7 special exception, you make certain the tree's death 8 and removal.

Traffic and pedestrian movements will be hindered and endangered and that is part of what you're looking at in your criteria. Their business model is a drive-thru expedient car wash. It's a quick in and out kind of a model.

Another thing that is -- is really difficult about this one is many of us heard a lot of what they had to say in the community meeting, and I want to thank them for hosting the community meeting. They were -- they gave us lots of time. They let people ask questions the whole time. There were some difficult people there that they dealt with really nicely and were patient with. It wasn't me. It was someone else, but they told us in the community meeting that they could not have the car wash here unless they had the variance for the tree and unless they could build closer to the tree. They told us

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

April 18, 2018 1 that. They told us at the community meeting they could not build the car wash here if they had to do 2 more than a five-foot sidewalk, that it would not 3 4 It was this gentleman, George, who said that. 5 GEORGE SHIELD: No. No. I did not sav 6 that. Thank you. 7 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: No. You guys -- let's 8 not have crosstalk. You can address it in your 9 rebuttal. 10 GEORGE SHIELD: Thank you. 11 SUSAN MILIKAN: Okay. So obviously they 12 met with staff more. Now they're going to try to do 13 the 12-foot multiuse path. They were very clear that 14 they needed the variance for the tree and the limb off of the tree to be able to operate the car wash there. 15 16 The tree is 61 inches DBH. So the way you measure that is across the front of the tree with a yardstick, 17 so that's five feet across. 18 The tree is five feet 19 If everybody could look -- at whichever slide it is, they want to come up 11 feet from the tree. 20 the tree is five feet across. It's huge. 21

I would ask BZA, if you're even thinking and -- and by your charge and by your criteria, the answer to so many of these is no. That means you have

to come within 11 feet.

22

23

24

25

They want

to deny this. If for whatever reason you don't deny
it, there has to be a 20 feet -- there has to be
20 feet for that grand tree to live. It has to be
more protected for pavement to go that close to it. I
worry more about pervious pavement because of all of
the pollutants out there.

When I was out there today, soapy water spews everywhere and the people that are parked, they have a big part of all these sprayers, and so they're out there spraying, spraying, spraying, vacuuming. When I was there, three dirty cars were parked that looked like they were -- someone had dropped off waited to be cleaned. Two cars were being sprayed and vacuumed, and then they had the drive-thru going, and I went through in the drive-thru. Because it's a drive-thru, I want you guys to think about our other driver-thrus on James Island. Chick-fil-A is situated where there's two ins and outs on two different McDonald's has two ins and outs on two different streets. Bo Jangles has two ins and outs on two different streets. It's like all these things are situated where there's a way to get in and out that's off the main road, and this is a drive-thru. This is why the Folly Road Overlay drafters asked for special exceptions for fast food restaurants, for vehicle

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

services, for gas stations because of the ins and outs. They're open at 7:00 a.m. to 8:00 p.m., label{eq:total\_state}

1 services, for gas stations because of the ins and outs. They're open at 7:00 a.m. to 8:00 p.m., label{eq:total\_state}

1 services, for gas stations because of the ins and outs.

Now they're not talking about the officer That's interesting. They're not talking tonight. about the officer tonight, because at the community meeting, they were going to have an off-duty deputy there to let people in and out. Then a lot of people in the audience started saying, we're worried about an off-duty deputy. He'll get hurt. He'll get hit. People are worried about rear ending. So they've got to have a cue for six cars to go through there. told us at the community meeting no cars would be idling onsite. Today, what I saw is -- you know, I was so confused about what was going on. They had to They were very nice to help me through it. Three cars would have been idling behind me if I would have been at lunch. So cars do idle onsite.

We know our deep, deep concern about that creek inlet and that beautiful oak doesn't matter. It doesn't matter. It's not really part of the criteria. I talked about what was, but it matters to us, and the reason why 1,900 people outside is because, Mr. Huff, your land, we love it.

PAULA HUFF: So do we.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

1	SUSAN MILIKAN: It's charming. It means
2	the world to us. This town should help you find
3	something to put there, and if we can spend money to
4	buy, we should all all of us in this room should do
5	everything we can to help this family realize their
6	retirement. Thank you.
7	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Ms. Milikan.
8	(Applause.)
9	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Derek Wade. Is Derek
10	still here?
11	DEREK WADE: Yes, ma'am.
12	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you.
13	DEREK WADE: Thank you very much. My name
14	is Derek Wade. I live at 7440 up on the hill road,
15	which is across the creek from this proposed side.
16	I'm a landscape designer and contractor. I have
17	27 years of experience in the low country here, and
18	I've seen commercial projects that come up out of the
19	ground and they don't always quite look like the
20	pretty pictures around here. So I have a couple of
21	concerns.
22	And with respect to the special exception,
23	I've heard the words talked spoken tonight
24	that talk about having concern about projects that
25	might adversely impact the general welfare and quality

```
110
 1
     of the community and that development should be well
 2
    planned and attractive. So I think this all falls
 3
    within your BZA jurisdiction, and I thank you very
 4
    much for your consideration.
 5
                 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you -- oh, I'm
 6
    sorry.
            I thought you were --
 7
                DEREK WADE: No, ma'am.
 8
                CHAIRWOMAN LYON:
                                  Keep going.
 9
                DEREK WADE:
                              I have a little bit more.
10
                CHAIRWOMAN LYON:
                                  Everyone else is.
11
                DEREK WADE: It's been a long time for all
12
    of us.
13
                CHAIRWOMAN LYON:
                                  It is. Keep going.
14
                DEREK WADE: I have concerns about traffic.
15
    Everybody talked about that. I have concerns about
    water quality. Particularly, when we have our
16
17
    tropical events here and -- with all due respect, I'm
    not sure how we keep that from flooding, but I'm sure
18
19
    you have an answer for that, and I'm particularly
20
    concerned about noise and light pollution when the
    old -- well, I won't get into any details.
21
22
                But my primary concern is -- is about the
   oak. We show on here, if I may -- we show on here a
23
   buffer of 11 feet on the outside of that oak and maybe
24
25
   22 feet going the other way. This oak is not in good
```

shape. This site is not particularly good for it. We all understand. That oak is tough and he's hanging in, and I would dare to say that the roots of that tree go well beyond the drip line. In fact, I would maintain that the roots of that plant probably extend well beyond the property and on the other side of the -- where the fence is going to go.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Here, here.

DEREK WADE: If you take the drip line --I'm not sure what the ordinance is, so you'll have to bear with me, but I'm assuming that the drip line is about 25 feet, and if you take it to 11 feet, you're about 50 percent of what the root zone is in that particular site, but I would maintain that the roots extend well beyond that. So when they dig the tanks, to put all of this stuff in the ground, they'll cut through the roots that are supporting on the tree on that far side. We should consider ourselves to be stewards of this beautiful plant and not view this plant as an inconvenient impediment. These rules are in place to protect our environment and our quality of life. This special exemption and particularly the variance of the -- on the tree protection would work against these very worthy objections.

And I hope that you would deny the variance

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

112 1 and the special exception. Thank you very much. 2 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Mr. Wade. 3 Nicole Bigola (phonetic)? Figola 4 (phonetic)? Has Nicole left? 5 Bill Lyon. 6 BILL LYON: My name is Bill Lyon. I live 7 at 6649 Fort Sumter. My concern is traffic. Road is one of the most traveled roads in the county. 8 9 Probably one of the most dangerous roads in the 10 county, and the area around the connector, and the 11 entrance to Bi-Los is the heaviest traffic traveled part of the road, so that's my big concern. 12 I -- I 13 just think it's going to make things worse. 14 During the summer, the traffic from Folly Beach gets very intense. I think we're going to just 15 intensify the problems that we already have. I really 16 feel for the Huffs. I understand that you need to 17 18 have a place -- need to sell the place for your retirement, but I just hope there's another way we can 19 20 do it. So thank you. 21 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Mr. Lyon. 22 T.L. Herbert. 23 TERRY HERBERT: I'm Terry Lynn Herbert. 24 live on Brantley Drive right next to the car wash. 25 And one of my major concerns is the traffic.

they're only going to allow to turn right, that's going to affect everybody coming out of O'Reilly's Auto Parts, which only has one egress on Brantley, and also the people that live on the street. Right now it -- even in non peak hours, I have a hard time getting out onto Folly Road even to turn right to go down to Bi-Lo. It's very difficult even at 8:00 o'clock at night. It's just awful.

So that's one of my main concerns, but I'm going to talk about some stuff that hasn't been addressed. The property is zoned AE-12. It slopes. It has a 10, 15-degree slope toward the marsh. So even with curbs that are supposed to collect the storm water or the rainwater that's washing off, you know -- and we have delusions. It just flows, and it's going to jump those curbs and go right into the marsh, just the way it does already. So unless they're going to level the property, which will kill the tree, we're going to have a problem with the way the land slopes right there right into the marsh and the creek.

The other thing that I'm going to address is the chemicals used. I was real surprised. I was given all of the material data -- material safety data sheets -- MSDS for short -- for all the chemicals used. They just don't use soap. And I have to --

this is funny. They call it shampoo, the car shampoo. 1 2 But they use waxes, they use sealants, they use polish, they use drying agents. And I am going to 3 leave you with all of this information on the 4 5 chemicals. Every single one of these MSDSs says, do 6 not allow to enter sewers, surface water or 7 groundwater. Right there in black and white. 8 these are government mandates.

All of them are eye irritants and skin So if your employees are standing around irritants. in the car wash, we're dealing with these sprays afterwards for the drying. They're going to be exposed to it. The MSDSs say, for the shampoo especially, because they contain phospates and the PH is very, very low, less than four for two of the chemicals, that they require protective gloves when handling and goggles for the very low PH ones, so. There is one that has very high alkaline PH, which is over 12, and it's very corrosive. So they have to wear goggles and gloves in dealing with these chemicals, and these are minimum wage people. they going to be trained and monitored to make sure that they're not harming themselves?

So I have all of my other concerns listed here, but those were the two, the traffic -- the

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

chemicals, the problem with the slope of the -- the 1 2 land going right into the marsh and -- and I do have a real concern about the tree because digging these 3 4 tanks and putting them underneath sea level is going to go below the 12-foot. It's going to go down. 5 6 That's below sea level. 7 What happens when we do get hurricanes and floods? What happens to all those chemicals that are 8 9 being stored in those tanks? Are they going to 10 overflow? We don't know, but there's always 11 accidents. You know, the oil companies always say

that, oh, we never spill any oil. Well, you know

So, currently, you don't see cars parking under the trees mainly because the trees leave all their residue. So they're going to have one of their major driveways going under the tree trying to get out onto Folly Road. They're just going to have to turn around and go back through the car wash, so — but it's also going to compact the surface even more than it is now and compacting those surface roots, the top 12 inches of a tree, the top 12 inches of the soil where the feeder roots are for the tree is very important to the survival and health of the tree. So I don't think driving and compacting on it is good for

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

better than that.

1	it. My last thing was, if you do allow it, we need a
2	traffic light at Grandview Drive, so we can get out of
3	the street. So I am going to leave you all of this.
4	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: If you could give it to
5	Ms. Simmons. She'll give it to everyone.
6	TERRY HOLBERT: And please share.
7	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: And make it part of the
8	record as well as the applicant.
9	TERRY HOLBERT: A collection of
10	professional scientific peer review articles as well
11	as the MSDSs and articles about from arborists all
12	over the country about what happens when you either
13	pave under or compact under big trees. So, please,
14	everybody, on the board, please consider that. Thank
15	you.
16	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Ms. Herbert.
17	Stewart Wineburg. Is Stewart still here?
18	STEWART WINEBURG: Yeah, I'm still here.
19	Good evening. Stewart Wineburg, Howard
20	Mary Drive on James Island. I was going to reiterate
21	everything that Carol Jackson said, Joe Qualey said
22	and Susan Milikan, but because of the late hour, I'm
23	just going to leave you with one thought. I'm so
24	inspired and excited about Rethink Folly Road. Can
25	that be your dream, too, as you make your decisions

April 18, 2018 117 1 regarding this? Thank you. 2 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Mr. Wineburg. 3 I believe Mary Beth Berry has -- is not 4 here. 5 Dawn Gibbs. Is Dawn Gibbs here? 6 Carla Muller? 7 CARLA MULLER: Good evening. My name is Carla Muller. I reside on 12 Commercial Row here on 8 James Island. Regarding these two special exceptions 9 that you all are looking at tonight, the first 10 11 exception truly does not meet the intent or the 12 purpose of either the James Island comprehensive plan 13 or the Folly Road Overlay. Too many people have put 14 in hours, days, months, years trying to get those 15 standards set, and we need to hold -- we need to be accountable to that. We need to think about, how is 16 17 this going to affect the traffic? It's horrible. 18 know that. Adding 40 cars in and out in an hour isn't going to make it better. We're going to increase car 19 pollution. We're also going to really increase the 20 21 sound, not just from the car wash itself, but two 22 minutes of vacuuming 40 cars an hour, those poor 23 neighbors. Do you want to hear a ShopVac every two 24 minutes vacuuming a car out? That just sounds

horrible to me.

1 My other issue is on the second special 2 exception with the grand oak tree. It's mv 3 understanding on average below the feeder roots of 4 this grand oak, that on average the roots start at 18 inches down. I don't think -- well, the tree crown 5 6 itself -- we need to keep in mind that the roots 7 spread horizontally four to seven times the width of that tree crown. So just looking at the diagram 8 9 behind me, it appears to me that those roots are going 10 to go right where those canisters or containers will 11 be dug out. And so essentially we will be cutting roots out of that tree and slowly killing that grand 12 13 oak tree that we all love. 14 So I ask you -- and I'm one of the 1,900 15 people that oppose this. Please take this very seriously and oppose both of those special exceptions. 16 17 Thank you. 18 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Ms. Muller. 19 Jenny Fowler. 20 JENNY FOWLER: Hi. Jenny Fowler, 1041 21

JENNY FOWLER: Hi. Jenny Fowler, 1041
Harbortowne Road. First, I'd like to say that my wife
was born and raised here in Charleston and her family
goes back to the 1600s, and we appreciate you
listening to all the locals. Both Trish and I did go
to the meeting on April 3rd and listened to what

22

23

24

Autobell said and explained their business plan, and although they certainly have a very interestingly way of recycling water, there were still a few red flags that I'd like to point out. We learned at that meeting that just 13 days ago they had no -- absolutely no idea that they were building on a flood zone.

Their plan of putting this water treatment facility in the basement of a low country area is quite interesting also. They also felt that the Folly Road traffic was at peak and that was about, you know, 14 days ago in the winter still, so it totally was not at peak.

This property is not only too small for such a business, but the location under the grand oak and next to the creek is a recipe for disaster, nature wise and traffic wise. I propose that this business plan was not well thought out as they think, for a placement on a lot in our low country and it will cause harm to our environment, which the laws and ordinances have been put in place to protect and also cause additional safety hazards for our roads. Thank you.

CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Ms. Fowler. Trish Fowler.

TRISH FOWLER: Hi. Trish Fowler, 1041
Harbortowne Road. I'll actually keep mine short like
I planned. I just wanted to state that we didn't, as
a community, create the environmental and community
development protections we have today, which are,
quite frankly, a day late and a dollar short to start
with just to exempt and accept them for profitable
endeavors.

Yes, the current development isn't perfect as it proceeded perfections in place today, but that doesn't mean that the next development shouldn't at least meet, if not exceed, what protections we've managed to squeeze into the current law. We didn't just create these protections to accept them. Please just say no.

And with all due respect to the Huff family and to your business and your part in this community, I know that you're advocating for this deal as a gateway to your retirement. And I respect that. I hope you get there. But no one is offering you a fair market value for the property. It's prime commercial property even with the environmental protections in place today. They — you can sell to someone more reasonable on the creek under a grand oak development plan. The very community that's sustained the Huffs

April 18, 2018 121 1 through your deckhands of business here is the 2 community that is today asking for protections. So I 3 don't feel that we're victimizing anyone in that. 4 I just wanted to also point out from what was said earlier that if they move the driveway south 5 6 to create more parking spaces or additional stacking 7 area that would be moving it under the tree. kind of mentioned that. So I wanted to say, I also 8 9 hope you will deny the variance and the special exception and consider the town motto written right 10 11 above your heads. I'm not going to risk pronouncing 12 it wrong, but it translates to, do not tread on us. 13 Thank you. 14 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Ms. Fowler. 15 (Applause.) 16 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Carolyn Mekus. Sorry. I 17 couldn't read. 18 CAROLYN MEKUS: Hi. My name is Carolyn 19 I live at 1578 Highland Avenue, and I'm 20 probably one of the younger folks here tonight, so I'm 21 really happy to represent a part of our younger 22 community and proud to live on James Island. I think this is wonderful, and thank you all for your service. 23 24

And to keep it very short, I would want to echo what Mr. Qualey and Ms. Jackson have said.

122 Really, really concerned about this. 1 I moved to James 2 Island because it's James Island, and because of the 3 way it is here. It doesn't look like Mount Pleasant. 4 It doesn't look like north Charleston. I'm from DC. It doesn't look like DC. This kind of does, but I'm 5 6 so happy, happy, happy to be here, and I simply can't 7 imagine that our community would be improved by something that will bring us more traffic. Something 8 9 that will go against the ordinances that I've looked 10 through, and, again, get me also very excited about the Rethink Folly Road plan. I imagine in quoting the 11 Folly Road plan, A, James Island Main Street, to me, a 12 13 full service car wash doesn't really fit the image of 14 a main street. I can't imagine another dual entrance drive-thru business right there on Folly Road where it 15 really is the busiest, busiest area of Folly Road. 16 17

I live on Highland and turning in and out of there is difficult enough, but my visits to Huff Seafood are also incredibly difficult to turn in and out of. I've nearly gotten rear ended so many times, but I go because of the cod. So in and out of there is super tough. It's so scary to turn in and out and then be -- I'm sure everyone has experienced that facing someone in the middle lanes and you think you're going to die. I just see this project doing

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

nothing but exacerbating these problems.

And so I really hope you would consider the community's concerns there and abide by the current regulations that are placed in the -- in the ordinances and not approve the exception of the variances that have been requested. Thank you so much.

CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you. Lindy Palmer. I don't think Lindy's here.

Anna Walston.

ANNA WALSTON: Anna Walston, 954 Nabors
Drive, Charleston, South Carolina. Thank you guys for
allowing us to speak and to speak for however long we
would like tonight, that I really appreciate.

You know, we are here contrary to what the attorney said because there is a reason to bring up the special ordinance after all of the information, at this point what you're being asked to rule on hasn't even been given to the people. Like, we don't know what it actually is going to look like. If we're going to talk about the turn ins and the turn outs and the way that they are, I live off of Harbor View, how — how quickly did we ruin the idea of not going right and left? Or instead of being able to go left from north shore onto Harbor View. How quickly did we

completely destroy that? Like, I see the city trucks 1 2 turning left to drive down Harbor View out of no 3 left-hand turn, so I don't understand how painting a 4 line and having a tiny curb without a light or 5 anything that's going to actually keep people from 6 making that illegal left-hand turn from their 7 business.

And with that being said, then is all of our insurance going to go up again because it wasn't properly -- or is the property owner for not enforcing their property going to be the one responsible? start factoring in all those things. Without actually having the plan all the way decided, we can't get parking space issues like actually concrete answered at this meeting. They had two hours, almost, that they spoke and didn't actually answer any big, big questions.

As far as the arbor stuff, I would like to To keep it within the 25 percent, does know this. that also include when we drill down and damage the root system or is it just above? Are these things that have been considered? Are these things that have been addressed? Are these things that have been looked over by the attorney on how that means, not just their arborist

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

When we do a traffic study, can we have it be for our actual Folly Road and not based on national standard? So as it stands tonight, I, as a concerned citizen, hope that you guys see that this is not meeting the requirements to grant the special ordinance and that they can come back and revisit again when they actually come through and show how it can get done to deserve a special ordinance. doesn't make sense at this point, and with the way that it has been presented with their plans, they've gone through -- are they allowed to raise their property elevation? I heard that question asked about, how there's a 10 to 15-foot slope currently on the property that goes straight into the marsh. are they going to do like the city allows where you can raise the property elevation up and then build your property at a higher elevation than what you purchased your property? We can use the Pulsy (phonetic) home development on Nabors Drive as an example of a property elevation going up higher post zoning approval without final plans being turned into the zoning of Charleston city.

So we have a unique opportunity as being town residents to come to our town BZA and ask you guys to actually look at it and see if it does match

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

up to every single occurrence for a special location.

I love the Huffs. I am so sorry that you guys want to retire right now. And it has to be difficult. You guys have been a staple here. You guys have been around longer than the connector, like not a lot of us have, but I just hope at this point with the way things stand, a lot of questions weren't actually answered. There was a lot of just roundabout talking.

So my vote is no, or my opinion is no. I don't have a vote, but my opinion is no based on the facts that are currently on the facts being presented by Autobell. Thank you. Oh. And I wasn't here on April the 3rd because I was celebrating my wedding anniversary, but I heard it was good, and I do appreciate that.

CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Ms. Walston. Margaret Fabri.

MARGARET FABRI: Good evening. I'm not going to talk long. My name is Margaret Fabri. I live at 770 Clearview Drive. I've lived on James Island for 34 years. I am an attorney, and I think I was most disturbed about what Mr. Appel, who I know, and is a very good attorney, said because I heard a verbose threat there. I think that we have all --

1	most of us in the community have worked long and hard
2	to get to the Folly Road Overlay District. This is
3	the first challenge that you have faced and to agree
4	that this should go forward when all of your special
5	exceptions, certainly the traffic, would tell you this
6	is not meeting your special exceptions for the
7	variance, so I would ask you obviously to deny it.
8	And I'm sorry that it's come to this. I
9	think a better place and a better situation on James
10	Island would make sense. This doesn't. And I think
11	Mr. Appel, by his own admission, said 40 cars in and
12	out in an hour, we could not sustain on Folly Road.
13	Thank you.
14	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Ms. Fabri.
15	Carolyn Bradner.
16	CAROLYN BRADNER: Carolyn Bradner, 328 East
17	Bay. I'll be quick. I'm here representing the
18	Coastal Conservation League. Please accept these
19	comments from the Coastal Conservation League. We do
20	not support the construction of a large car wash in
21	this location. It's located by the creek, highly
22	polluted. Definitely a concern. It is designated EE,
23	hundred-year floodplain. We, of course, know that is
24	not a rare occurrence anymore.
25	Negative impacts of the grand tree are a

129 1 and address. 2 CAROL DELCHER: My name is Carol Delcher. 3 I live at 1732 Brantley Drive --4 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you. 5 CAROL DELCHER: -- James Island. I live 6 next to Ms. Herbert. 7 Okay. This is the companies that they represent and their investors. There's nothing here 8 9 that is suitable for the location. 10 You know I love you; okay? I'd do anything for you all. I'll start a fund. I'll put the first 11 12 thousand in, but we've got to do something. A car 13 wash is not it, but nothing here is insight with 14 anything that's there. 15 This is a -- the company review from one 16 location taken off of the Internet, there's one of 80 in here that was positive, and that's just one 17 18 location. This is your Alpharetta, Georgia, location. 19 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: We should probably give 20 this to Ms. Simmons, and she can make copies for 21 everyone. 22 CAROL DELCHER: Okay. I have an 23 audiologist piece of paper concerning the decibel 24 noises and such, and I'll just read this. It says, for fences, heights of 10 to 15 feet are usually 25

130 required to achieve a significant noise reduction. 1 It 2 also says, if a town is most interested in the impact a wash has on a residential neighborhood, then an 3 ambient noise study is recommended. This right here 4 is also noise off the Internet and has to do with 5 noise decibels and all that good stuff, and it's a 6 good read, but basically it says, you don't want a car 7 8 wash in your neighborhood. This is Acoustic 9 Associates, also off the Internet, which tells you 10 noise emission out of Chicago, Fuller Car Wash, but 11 it's interesting to note and you may say that you've got a new -- new system and -- and you're quieter than 12 13 I'm sorry, you're not. the traffic.

Okay. Also we have here -- she covered some of the chemicals, Rain Guard, high sprays, non water chemicals and such, but this is a company profile about Autobell. It says here -- and I've just made a couple quick notes, but it's a good read. They have four million cars, 80 businesses. Four million divided by 80 average, that's more cars on Folly Road, 50,000 vehicles a year. Who's going to pay for the infrastructure to get the roads repaired? Charleston County right now has a 10-year budget that deals with a million dollars, and we've already spent 10 million going toward Charleston County, toward Folly Road and

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

131 1 six million by the Windemere section. 2 Who is going to pay for the Okav. additional road work? We are. All of us. All of us. 3 4 They're not. 5 Ms. Herbert also covered some of the detergents and such dealing with their recycled water 6 7 This is a tank on top of the ground. This is what 8 they got at their other facilities, so they're 9 planning on killing an oak tree by burying tanks. Anybody that has machinery, engines, a pump, knows it 10 11 leaks. Knows it needs repaired. That means you have to have vertical access to it. And USC, when I worked 12 13 for them, they built right next to Charleston County 14 They built an in-ground facility Memorial Hospital. with all the wiring systems and such. 15 That was a 16 humongous escapade. I can't see you profiting in this. Honestly, I can't see your profit. Why are you 17 going to go into so much? Why are you going to set it 18 19 up and leave us? 20 All right. Sorry about that. I get 21 carried like the rest of us. 22 Okay. Recycled water. Not on my car, if it leaks. And what about the oil in the pavement? 23 The detergents? The oils? What if -- storm damage

24

25

cause and effect should not be anywhere near, I think,

April 18, 2018 132 3,000 feet of a residential or waterway. 1 2 Now let's talk about the people that work 3 for this company. Mr. Richard Davies. He's a Clemson 4 guy, but he lives in North Carolina. He started this business in 1997, so he's got his credentials. He's 5 6 made his bucks and such. 7 Mr. Orman, you've only been with the company since April 2014. Go hire your expert. 8 9 Okay. Ms. Abbey Trammel (phonetic). She's on the payroll, too. She's the one that provided the 10 11 plans. Okay. She's May of 2014. 12 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: This is not appropriate 13 point of order, madam chairman. 14 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Excuse me. This -- this 15 is really not appropriate to discuss the applicant. 16 CAROL DELCHER: I think it is appropriate, because we're dealing with a company that sets up a 17 business in our neighborhood and wants us to accept 18 19 them as a trustworthy business. 20 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Ms. Delcher, we're 21 just --22 CAROL DELCHER: All right. I'll move on. 23 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: -- on the issue and it's 24 really late, and we have a lot of people that want to

speak, too.

CAROL DELCHER: I realize that and everybody else got their do.

Okay. This right here is a water -- wash water testing method. It's dealing with locations of sampling for car washes, and it says here that due to the large number of vehicles washed and the volume of wash water generated event organizes were required to install a car wash kit to divert the flow away from the storm water system. So it's their system that's being emptied into our sewer system going to be an impact on us later on?

This also here is just a little information about our deceleration lanes and such. They want to use our deceleration lane, which is our turning lanes off -- in the middle of Folly Road. You can't even get off our street in 10 to 15 minutes. I mean, it's horrible, you know, and that is on non peak times or peak times. Peak times is even worse. There's -- the drivers are mad. They don't have no respect like they used to have. Let somebody go in front or whatever. It's not happening these days. These people say, get out of my way. There's road rage. And the comings and goings, the egress and the ingress out of this one place is going to be a madhouse for us all. This is a community-wide problem.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

Anybody that works or lives on James Island goes to the beach. Anybody is going to deal with this and, you know, anybody going to the beach, they're going to come back and wash their cars or whatever.

No doubt. It's going to make plenty of money at our headache.

Okay. I provided this packet to you,

Ms. Simmons, already in dealing with my letter. I

wrote a letter on the February 18th. I attended the

March 20th meeting, and I see that on March the 12th.

You know, I got notification online, you know, that

they had submitted the withdrawal, and, okay, that's

fine, they withdrew, and then I questioned — while I

couldn't question because I only had two minutes to

talk, so I really couldn't get into it and everything,

and I wasn't going to waste my time listening to a

spiel on April the 3rd of what we just did. So all of

us attended that meeting whether we liked it or not.

All right. The thing is, I, we, meaning me and my husband, who have signed this paperwork respectfully ask under Section 6-29-915-A to be a person who is not the owner of the property but may petition to intervene as a party, and this motion must be granted if the person has a substantial interest in the decision of the board of architectural review on

```
135
    E -- capital E -- and land use or other change agreed
 1
    to in mediation to the parcels. I resubmit and submit
 2
 3
    in accordance with South Carolina code of law Section
    48-39-150-D, additional information and material in
 4
    further protest that I, we, be agreed by a decision --
 5
 6
                UNIDENTIFIED MALE: We're going to have
 7
    to --
 8
                CAROL DELCHER: -- to grant application --
 9
                UNIDENTIFIED MALE: We're going to have to
10
    cut it short.
11
                CHAIRWOMAN LYON: We're sorry, we'll have
12
    to cut it short.
13
                CAROL DELCHER: -- really doesn't apply.
14
                CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Excuse me.
                                               This does not
15
            You're supposed to just speak according to the
16
    case.
           This offers no new evidence.
17
                CAROL DELCHER: Yes, ma'am, it does.
18
                CHAIRWOMAN LYON:
                                  It's 10:15 at night.
19
                CAROL DELCHER: Yes, ma'am, it does.
20
                CHAIRWOMAN LYON: We really need -- we've
    got two and a half more pages of people who would like
21
22
    to speak.
23
                CAROL DELCHER:
                               Ms. Simmons has my -- Ms.
24
   Simmons has my -- this is my five pages. I'm going to
25
   provide --
```

```
136
 1
                 CHAIRWOMAN LYON:
                                   If you could leave copies
 2
    of that.
 3
                CAROL DELCHER: I'm giving the whole thing
 4
    to your attorney.
 5
                CHAIRWOMAN LYON: That would be great.
 6
    Thank you.
 7
                CAROL DELCHER: The whole thing to your
 8
               I expect -- I have copies of everything.
 9
    So there you go.
10
                And, Ms. Simmons, you can have a --
11
                CHAIRWOMAN LYON:
                                   Theresa Ray.
12
                CAROL DELCHER: He needs (inaudible); okay?
13
    We'll work it out for you.
14
                CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Ms. Delcher.
15
                Theresa Ray.
16
                CAROL DELCHER: Not a place for a car wash.
17
                CHAIRWOMAN LYON:
                                  Samantha Siegel.
18
                SAMANTHA SIEGEL:
                                  Hello.
                                          My name is
    Samantha Siegel. I live at 5 Blue Andre (phonetic)
19
20
    Avenue in Avondale, West Ashley. I am the founder of
    a grass-roots organization called, Save the Angel Oak,
21
22
    which was formed in 2007, as a result of a proposal to
23
    develop land surrounding the iconic angel oak by
24
    filling wetlands and encroaching upon grand trees on
25
    the property. And coincidentally, George Field was a
```

partner in that field development so many years ago.

So I'm here today to ask you to deny the special exception request and variance for the car And as with the case of the angel oak, we were successful after a long drawn out battle and years' long lawsuit, but this is what citizens will go to, to protect what they love. When we were studying the angel oak case, there were -- we had lots of expert arborists, hydrologists, water reports, and we heard a similar story about the arborist saying the tree would be okay. He was a world-renown arborist who consulted at the White House and turned out that he was wrong, and so that was proven with the court. Same with the hydrologist who said all the storm water would stay on site and they had all these great new models, and they turned out to be wrong as well, as were proved in court.

So I will try and keep it short. Just cutting off a major limb off of a grand oak tree does not preserve it and makes the tree more susceptible to disease. Encroaching on the tree canopy with pervious services will endanger the health and lifespan of the tree. And also the natural feature of the creek is not incorporated into this plan, and I find it hard to believe that the storm water will stay onsite.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

So I would ask you to deny the variance and

special exception request. Thank you so much.

CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Ms. Siegel. Emily Varrett (phonetic).

EMILY VARRETT: Emily Varrett, 307 Yates Avenue, a lifelong resident of James Island, and I appreciate you all letting us speak this late. don't think I'm fully awake right now.

Anyway, what my main concern has been this whole time, of course, is the traffic, and one of the things I've been listening to everyone talk and -- by the way, I say ditto to everything that was said ahead of me, but Dr. Sperry's got a very good point. don't know if the traffic engineer has taken into consideration about the number of people who truly do come from downtown, the college students, everyone who comes over and uses Harris Teeter.

What we heard in the community meeting -which I do appreciate you all having the community meeting -- thank you -- we heard that there was going to be an off-duty police officer to help direct traffic out of there because it's a nightmare. Now we're hearing right turn only, which, as we know, nobody on north shore will forget it. These college kids will try to take a north, a left turn out of

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

there anyway. The traffic is going to back up on there going in, and they'll take a right. Have we considered the impact down the road? What's everyone going to do? Go down to Chick-fil-A, cut through their parking lot to come out of the lake and go back I know I plan my travel on Folly Road based around? on being able to get in and out of places. And I look at ways before I leave my house off of Maybank to see if I can get to Bi-Lo safely on Folly Road. there's too many unknowns right now in the traffic and the impact to all of us driving to nearby businesses to nearby neighbors to even grant this exception, and the only thing I like about the Folly Road Overlay is just because the barn door is open doesn't mean it can't be closed. Thank you.

CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you.

Jenny Welch.

JENNY WELCH: Hi. My name is Jenny Welch. I live off of East and West Road. I've lived here all of my life. I really worry about you granting the special exception because I feel like it's become a domino effect and that applicants will start asking for more and more special exceptions down Folly Road, meaning that we'll just get more and more fast food restaurants, more gas stations, more car washes, and

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

140 this is not what we want on James Island, and that 1 2 just negates the whole point of the Folly Road 3 So I ask that you really consider a special 4 exception because I'm just really worried that it will 5 just magnify all over our island. 6 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Ms. Welch. 7 Jessica Norris. 8 JESSICA NORRIS: Hi. I'm Jessica Norris at 9 1227 Oak Press (phonetic) Drive, and I really appreciate the hard work of your committee. And thank 10 11 you for your time. I know that you're charged with 12 creating a low risk and positive environment for 13 investment and that you can't afford to and it doesn't serve our best interest to have you act in a 14 15 capricious and arbitrary manner, but with that said, I don't think that turning down this special exemption 16 would be either of those things. We have heard and 17 18 all know that this flies in the face of both the 19 letter and intent of the Folly Road Overlay. 20 I have -- my training is in ecology. have a Ph.D. in ecology from Duke, and I also am here 21 22 representing the 1,100 members of the Charleston Natural History Society or Charleston Audubon, which 23 24 was formed in 1905. I am -- in my professional life,

25

I'm also an ecologist with bio habitats, which is a

design and planning firm that specializes in low impact and site design, so that regularly puts me on the other side of this meeting in doing permitting and outreach, and I can pretty much attest that this is my worst nightmare, if I were having to do this presentation. But as you might guess, part of not ending up in the situation is proposing a smart development that's appropriate for the site, and I can assure you that my objections to this car wash are not because of a technical misunderstanding.

Although, thank you, Mr. Shield, for suggests that that was the reason we were opposing it. And I'd also like to point out that I'm not an immediate neighbor with a personal stake in the development as a close-by thing to my house.

Nevertheless, I don't think it takes great expertise or insight to find fault with this design on this site, and thanks to the wonderful eloquence of my predecessors, most of my predecessors. I'll cut short several of the things that I was prepared to say. You can also find them -- I think the Charleston Audubon Trust and Natural History Society submitted a letter. It should be in your packets, but I did want to just point out two things that are narrowly focused on the factors that probably speak most about the criteria in

preserving and incorporating the most natural The first of these that I haven't heard mentioned today is habitat connectivity. So in an urban environment or a suburban environment, creeks and waterways serve sort of as a superhighway for connectivity for wildlife, including birds and amphibians and insects, and these sorts of suburban wildlife are actually important assets to our -- our Intensive quasi-industrial development communities. will have a negative effect on these -- on the wildlife that are using this creek, and that's why it's so important to keep really in -- hugely intensive development away from the quarters of the creek.

I just lost a thread.

The second thing I wanted to just mention is that our concerns about hydrologic and floodplain connectivity on James Island are pressing, and real flooding is probably one of the most pressing planning issues on our island, and we need to be improving our water management and reducing our flood risk rather than intensifying it. Charleston, as you probably know, is expected to have 180 days of sunny day or that is title flooding by 2045, and having worked with a wide range of out-of-town developers and architects,

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

I can almost guarantee that our designs are not actually appropriate for the storm surges and sea level rise combination that we're expecting to hear.

With that said, I know adhering to your current codes, but I would point out that Mount Pleasant, for instance, is in the midst of adjusting their OCRM buffer line back to 50 percent or back to 50 feet. There is problems with it, but nevertheless, they are realizing that that is the future of where we're headed because we can't afford to continue development this close to our OCRM buffer lines.

I think that's about all I wanted to mention. Those are the things that I had that were a little bit different from what I heard other people say. I do think that approving this car wash just puts you on the wrong side of history on this island, doing developments right next to flooding areas and floodplains next to title creeks is not going to be sustainable on James Island, and I do sincerely hope that the Huffs find a great buyer for their beautiful property. Unfortunately, I don't think this car wash is right for this site and I encourage you to reject this special exception. Thank you.

CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Ms. Norris.
Marie Cannon?

AWR

	7711110, 2011
1	Melanie Jones?
2	Becky Timpner (phonetic)?
3	Mike Fony (phonetic)?
4	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Is there anybody that
5	hadn't spoken yet?
6	PAULA HUFF: I would like to speak. I did
7	not go up and sign up, if I may.
8	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Sure. Yeah.
9	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Let's huh?
10	PAULA HUFF: It won't be long.
11	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Were you sworn in? Are
12	you Mrs. Huff?
13	PAULA HUFF: Yes.
14	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Your name is on here.
15	We're still doing the against, but if the rest of the
16	board is okay with these
17	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yeah. There's nobody
18	else over here.
19	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: we can do that. If
20	nobody else wants to speak against it, we'll wrap that
21	up.
22	Ms. Huff, would you please come up. That
23	would be great.
24	PAULA HUFF: Okay. I'm Paula Huff. I'm at
25	1211 Stone Post Road, and we own Huff Seafood.
- 1	

A couple of questions that I heard everybody concerned about is pollution of Ellis Creek, and unless you're -- lived there -- there -- we have like a five-foot pipe where all the drainage from Folly Road goes right down that creek. It is tearing up the property across from us. Got a big oak tree over there that's going to be falling over because that drain water from every time it rains and the car wash across the street and -- and that gas station, when they pressure wash their gas, it goes down into the storm water, right in your creek that is polluted. That's why it's polluted.

The other thing I heard about were concerns about was flooding. We have been there since 1995.

And through all of the storms, even Irma -- Irma at our house, we had breakers in our front yard on Stone Post. There was no flooding. It never made it up to the driveway at our business.

Every once in a while, if you've got a lot of rain and super-high tide, it will go up to the edge of that blue building, the smaller blue bidding, but as far as getting in our driveway, never happened. And I understand even when Hugo came through, they didn't have water in the parking lot then either. And that's all I have to say.

1 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Ms. Huff. 2 Anyone else wishing to speak for or 3 against? 4 I'd like to thank everyone who stayed and stuck it out, and I'll give the applicant a chance to 5 6 I know it's been a long night and I know some rebut. 7 of you all stated you had never seen this done in a meeting before, but we felt like it was really 8 9 important to give everybody a chance to speak. 10 some meetings I've heard about, like, I think one 11 tonight, the public was only going to get to speak for like 15 minutes. I know counsel does that, and you 12 13 have to get there early and be one of a handful of 14 people to speak, and that's not really fair to the 15 public, and for the applicant, who has such an involved, complicated and important to them 16 17 presentation, it's not fair to limit it to five 18 minutes, but it is up to the BZA. We voted to do it. And thank you all for staying until 10:25, and now 19 we'll continue on with the applicant's rebuttal to any 20 21 of the opposition. 22 ROSS APPEL:

ROSS APPEL: Thank you, BZA members, and thank you to the public that are still here that have offered their comments tonight.

I just want to address a few sort of points

23

24

of order, so to speak, or maybe going through some of the specific objections that have been raised in addressing them.

One of the most important things at these BZA meetings to keep in mind, in addition to scope of authority and scope of legal authority is the issue of competent testimony and that phrase competent testimony is a legal term of art. It is a phrase that appears in multiple case law decisions by the South Carolina Supreme Court, South Carolina Court of Appeals, the Windham Enterprises, LLC, versus North Augusta case, South Carolina Court of Appeals 2012, and in the Bannum, Incorporated, versus City of Columbia case from the Supreme Court, 1999. It's a lot of complicated stuff.

But here's the point: If you're not an expert, you're not allowed to testify about matters involving technical expertise, and I just have to note this for the record that everything you heard today from the opposition involving traffic, flooding, car washes and environmental pollutants, chemicals, noise, other people's properties values -- I'm sure I'm missing things -- but anything involving technical expertise that they don't have a technical degree in or a professional degree in is literally supposed to

be stricken from the record, and it is unlawful as a matter of law for this board to even consider it in making their decisions and that's important. This is not court. You are all not judges, but you all serve a quasi-judicial capacity.

And I want to say another thing. These people are not your constituents. You're not an elected official. You're not an elected official. They're not an elected official. I serve on the City of Charleston Board of Zoning Appeals. I'm not an elected official. You all are quasi-judicial officers. You all are here only to interpret the ordinances as written.

If you think the Folly Corridor Overlay's District prevents a car wash, you're wrong. If you think that all the town's planning activities and zoning activities over the years and plans and this and that prevent what we're proposing today, I'm sorry, but that's just simply not accurate, and it's not a correct statement of the law.

While there is a lot of passion and a lot of legitimate concern from the opposition, I grew up in Charleston. I'm fifth-generation Charleston. I live north of here in south Windemere, so I'm familiar with Folly Road and, you know, how important and

special this place is. I've represented the Costal Conversation League in the past on things. I have an environmental law background. I get it.

What Samantha did with the angel oak was amazing, but as she acknowledged in that case, what made that case go was not a lot of people just sort of talking off the cuff about trees and tree health and things of that nature. The only people here with competent testimony about trees is Autobell. The only people in this room with competent testimony about traffic is Autobell. The only people in this room with engineering expertise is Autobell. The only people that can speak from the standpoint of somebody who's been in the car wash business for decades is Autobell. The only people here to talk about chemicals and bio reclamation and water is Autobell. That matters. That is not just persuasion points. That is legal material significant for this decision today.

The other thing I want to talk about is the scope of the board's decision on this matter. Believe it or not, we're not even halfway through tonight. We are only here on the special exception right now. There's a lot of talk about the variance and what's required for the tree canopy exception. That's a

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

whole other presentation we haven't even done. 1 We're 2 talking right now about the special exception. You 3 all heard my talk in the beginning -- oh, I forgot. There's no -- well, Ms. Fabri is a lawyer, but I don't 4 think she really addressed head on my points, and we 5 6 can kind of have a legal discussion about that one 7 day, but the fact of the matter is, is like I said in the beginning, we don't believe a special exception is 8 even required. The Folly Road Overlay does not 9 require car washes to have a special exception. 10 It 11 only requires vehicle service uses to have a special exception. We're not a vehicle service use. 12 13 vehicle service limited use. Vehicle service limited The overlay does not contain the word limited 14 15 and that is going to be a fatal, fatal flaw if this 16 special exception is denied.

Let's see. I want to run -- there's been a lot that's been put on the table. I forgot to mention Joe Qualey. He's also a lawyer that I have highly respect for and that I've worked in the past, but he didn't really address any legal concerns. You know, he made a comment that I wrote down, that this proposed use is a poster child for what we don't want. Well, that's not what the community commercial zoning district says, and it's not what the Folly Road

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

151 1 Overlay says, as I pointed out. 2 Joe talked about traffic. Joe's not 3 competent to talk about traffic. Don't tell him I said he was incompetent, but I don't mean it like the 4 way you say it on the street. This is a legal --5 6 CAROL DELCHER: Are you going to reprimand 7 him the same you did me? Please. 8 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Excuse me. 9 ROSS APPEL: And -- and I have to address 10 something else that the phrase that our folks need to 11 pack up and go somewhere else. It's really 12 inappropriate, and frankly, I don't think it's 13 appropriate for local politicians to be addressing 14 this board. This is a quasi-judicial forum. 15 people that passed the laws should not be involved in the application of the laws. There's -- there's a 16 17 separation of power issues. I appreciate the fact that they're here and they've got constituents, but 18 the way they serve the constituents by passing the law 19 at their level and focusing on what their 20 21 respectful --22 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Let's speak to the 23 issue. 24 ROSS APPEL: You know, I don't want to single out people, but we heard over and over people 25

talking about traffic and the environment and noise.

Almost none of it is relevant and all of it's legally excluded.

Oh. I want to address this timeliness issue with the application and the filing. We had our application filed on March 20th, 2018. What we did do and what the town allows is for the application to be supplemented with additional supporting information. That is what we've done. That's what the opposition has done, and Kristen has confirmed with me in e-mails that everything submitted prior to tonight's hearing is included in the record. We're not going to try to exclude anything of theirs, and we respectfully don't wish to have anything excluded from our side of the equation.

However, I will say that to the extent some of those in the opposition have attempted to introduce technical documents into -- into the record from the Internet or things of that nature. That's not considered expert testimony. In order for experts to get things in the record, they have to be here like our folks were here tonight.

CHAIRWOMAN LYON: It wasn't called expert testimony. Anything that's brought, we put it in the record for you all and us.

ROSS APPEL: Sure. And --

CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you.

ROSS APPEL: -- I think it's appropriate for it to be in the record, but it's not appropriate to be considered.

This whole talk of -- and I'm just going to try to speak now to the legal issues. There was some talk at one point about the car wash not serving the purpose and intent of the community commercial zoning district. The table of uses explicitly allows car washes in the community commercial district. issue is just black and white. This is an allowed use, and it's consistent with the underlying zoning, and it's consistent with the comprehensive plan. didn't pass the comprehensive plan. It was the town planning commissions and the town council that did that, and they've said this -- this property is supposed to be commercial both in the zoning and in the comprehensive plan. This is not an industrial use.

There was mention at one point about

Autobell being sued over noise complaints. I spoke
with Carl briefly. That's completely baseless and not
an accurate fact.

All right, guys. I appreciate it. Thank

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1	you for your time. As fellow BZA members, I I
2	respect what you all are doing here. You've got a lot
3	on your hands. And if there's anything else I can
4	help with or any of our team can help with, we'd be
5	happy to answer those questions, and we, again,
6	appreciate your time. Thank you.
7	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you.
8	Any other comments from the owner or the
9	Mr. Howard?
10	CARL HOWARD: I thank everybody. It's
11	late. I don't want to push it any further. I
12	appreciate your time and consideration.
13	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Mr. Howard.
14	CARL HOWARD: Thank you.
15	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: At this time I'll close
16	the hearing to the public.
17	Is there a motion from the board and a
18	second in order to have a discussion?
19	ROY SMITH: So moved.
20	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: What's your motion? We
21	need a motion from one of the board members to
22	approve, deny or approve with conditions. Is there a
23	motion to approve?
24	ROY SMITH: I I move to deny this
25	motion, this this special exception.

CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Is there a second?

JIM FRALIX: Second.

CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Discussion?

ROY SMITH: Well, I can only start by saying that I have heard a lot tonight from a lot of people, and I think that I can also observe their demeanor as well as their — their being an expert or not being an expert. Although, I think that I heard that the only experts were from Autobell, but I did hear some of the other people who spoke give quite some credentials. Everything from knowing a good bit about trees to knowing a good bit about the environment, and those people did not feel that this business place, where it is, would be good for several reasons, and they found that to be at variance with the comprehensive plan as well as the Folly Overlay District.

I also heard that, that a business like this is not sustainable, and I've always had trouble with the definition of sustainable, but I found that it's actually defined at the back in our comprehensive plan, so I think that very well may be true. We do have a lot of flooding, and we have a lot of -- a lot of things that go on over time that -- I don't know that, that has been -- or I would say that, that has

1	156
1	not been addressed to my satisfaction. I know that
2	materials and machinery break down. It doesn't always
3	run as smoothly and quietly as purported. I wish that
4	my car did, but it doesn't. Things do change over
5	time.
6	I read somewhere earlier in one of these
7	documents, I think, something about catching water in
8	drainage structures or drains, and I know that
9	sometimes those clog up. At least they do in my
10	neighborhood. I know that people can come and clean
11	them out, but it doesn't always happen in a timely
12	matter, and it doesn't often right before we have a
13	flood event for whatever reason.
14	So for those reasons, I would like to say
15	that I'm not in support of this business at this at
16	this location.
17	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Mr. Smith.
18	I have a problem. I feel like it does not
19	meet criteria A where it states and does not
20	negatively impact the surrounding community.
21	Obviously, it negatively impacts the surrounding
22	community by the, you know, response that we've seen.
23	In addition, I'm also concerned it doesn't
24	appear to meet the criteria of number F where

vehicular traffic and pedestrian movement on adjacent

157 road shall not be hindered or endangered. 1 And I think, you know, when I did my site visit yesterday, 2 it is very precarious walking along there, and if 3 there was another business there with that much 4 traffic in and out, that would adversely affect 5 6 pedestrian traffic, and then the vehicular traffic, it 7 is -- I mean, we're not even halfway to peak season. Summertime is just crazy, as those who live here know 8 with the traffic backing up, and I just feel like it 9 doesn't meet that criteria either, and I would be 10 11 inclined to vote against -- against it as well. 12 are my thoughts. 13 Mr. Gregorie, do you have any comments or 14 thoughts? 15 JASON GREGORIE: Sure. 16 So I've been evaluating this based on the 17 criteria set forth in the ordinance. I read Mr. Appel's thorough examinations or his thorough 18 analysis and legal test last night and again today. I 19 20 think it was a very thorough analysis. I think many of the things he's put forth on the record may not be 21 or are not applicable for us but may be applicable for 22 a higher level of jurisprudence, and so I've, at least 23 24 in my mind, tried to sort through some of the

25

information that's been presented and stick to what I

April 18, 2018 believe is applicable here for us as set forth right 1 2 now. 3 My concern -- I have a few concerns, and I'll address why I don't think it meets the ordinance 4 5 in this location. I think the 61-inch deviates the grand tree is a very significant feature of our 6 7 community. It's the largest one we've taken up so far 8 at BZA. As Ms. Crane mentioned earlier, we have not, 9 at BZA, taken up a tree of this magnitude. 10 I have concerns that buried tanks -- an entire intensive development of this site that 11 12 includes buried tanks and also pavement all around 13 this tree could damage the tree, and I think that 14 that's an important feature. So I think that that 15 affects D of the ordinance. 16 I also have a major concern with F, which is the vehicle traffic section of the ordinance. 17 Vehicle traffic and pedestrian movement on adjacent 18 19 road shall not be hindered or endangered. concerns of the stacking. Their diagram, which is the 20 21 second one submitted to us, which is dated April 13th, 22 2018, shows eight vehicles, what I would call, 23 stacked. During the presentation, they said they

I have experienced the inability to

24

25

likely could have 10 vehicles stacked.

1	traverse Folly Road myself. For example, at a
2	neighboring parcel, I could not take even turn onto
3	Rivers Point Row because of a stack of vehicles at
4	Starbucks recently. I mean, we had a thoroughfare.
5	Rivers Point Row was intraversible because of a
6	vehicle stack on a Saturday morning. And I have
7	concerns about creating additional vehicle stacks and
8	vehicles stopped on Folly Road.
9	So for that reason, I am going to say that
10	I don't believe what has been presented meets F of the
11	ordinance.
12	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you, Mr. Gregorie.
13	Mr Mr. Parrish, do you got any
14	comments?
15	SIM PARRISH: I just want to say that I
16	agree with what Jason has said and Roy has said and
17	their concerns with the traffic stacking and the
18	possibility of damaging the tree beyond what they say
19	they won't do.
20	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Thank you.
21	Mr. Fralix, any comments?
22	JIM FRALIX: I'm concerned about those
23	things, too, but I'm also concerned that we have a
24	situation here where 1,900 people, 1,900 citizens
25	signed something that said they did not agree with

```
160
 1
    this.
            That, to me, is very significant.
                                               I wouldn't
 2
    tell them that in this forum, but that's not to be
 3
    taken lightly.
 4
                 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Any other comments?
 5
    Discussion?
 6
                 Thank you, Mr. Fralix.
 7
                SIM PARRISH:
                               I have -- I have one
 8
    question, and this is --
 9
                CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Mr. Parrish.
10
                SIM PARRISH:
                               This goes back to the
11
    information that was provided by Mr. Appel that -- is
12
    there a reason why we did not get a complete copy of
13
    the comprehensive plan in the information that they
    provided? And the reason I'm asking is, in the table
14
15
    that they had in here under the section that it said
16
    the zoning district table that's in here down in
17
    the -- on page two of the table, it says vehicle
18
    services limited, including all automotive oil change
19
    or lubrication shops or car washes. And it references
20
    in the right-hand column a condition, which was not
    included in the packet, and I was wondering --
21
22
                CHAIRWOMAN LYON:
                                  It's my understand --
   well, we had a copy e-mailed out to us today, and I
23
24
    know we all received one with training. So, you know,
25
   we've all got it to reference.
```

1	Does that answer your question?
2	Okay. But it was it was also included
3	in an electronic e-mail as requested by the applicant.
4	The applicant has not provided hard copies for that.
5	In fact, I believe that just came up in the last day
6	or two; is that correct? So but, yes. And it's
7	obviously been addressed and discussed at length
8	tonight by the applicant as well as
9	SIM PARRISH: Okay.
10	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: our our training.
11	ROSS APPEL: Can I say one sentence?
12	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: No. We are we are in
13	discussion, and that is not appropriate.
14	ROSS APPEL: That's another thing we'll
15	object to.
16	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Any other questions? Or
17	comments?
18	JIM FRALIX: I move we adjourn.
19	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: We haven't voted on the
20	motion. And we have another case to do. We can't do
21	that yet, Mr. Fralix.
22	JIM FRALIX: All right. Well
23	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: We have a motion on the
24	l
	floor to to deny the

```
1
                 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Let me read it -- I'm
 2
    sorry -- to deny the special request for the placement
 3
    of a full service car wash in the Community CC
 4
    District. It's been -- the motion was made by
 5
    Mr. Smith, and it was seconded by Mr. Fralix.
 6
                Would you please do a rollcall vote,
 7
    Ms. Simmons.
 8
                FRANCES SIMMONS: Mr. Fralix?
 9
                JIM FRALIX:
                              I vote for the motion.
10
                CHAIRWOMAN LYON: We are voting to deny.
11
    Let me just make that clear. Thank you.
12
                FRANCES SIMMONS: Mr. Parrish?
13
                SIM PARRISH: I am for the motion.
14
                FRANCES SIMMONS: Mr. Gregorie?
15
                JASON GREGORIE:
                                 Aye...
16
                FRANCES SIMMONS: Mr. Smith?
17
                ROY SMITH: I am for the motion, which is
18
    to deny the car wash.
19
                FRANCES SIMMONS: Chairwoman Lyon.
20
                CHAIRWOMAN LYON: I'm for the motion to
21
    deny the car wash.
22
                Thank you, Ms. Simmons.
23
                The ayes have it. It passed unanimously to
24
    deny the car wash. I will state the legal reason.
25
    The -- it did not meet the criteria A, D and E.
```

1 sorry, F. Let me restate that. I'm sorry you all. I'm really tired. It did not meet the criteria A, D 2 3 and F for the record. 4 JIM FRALIX: This might be the longest 5 meeting on record. 6 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: It is, and it's not over 7 yet. 8 JIM FRALIX: Yeah, I know. 9 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: The final decision will be mailed to you within 10 working days, and you may 10 11 contact planning and zoning staff with any questions about the denial approval or conditions, and as you 12 13 know, you have 30 days to appeal as -- we will now 14 hear case number BZAV-3-18-014. If you want to 15 proceed with that. ROSS APPEL: Yeah. So we -- we would 16 request that that application just be put on -- on 17 18 hold until we can resolve this other matter. 19 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Okay. That will count as 20 a withdrawal, which would mean at least a year's wait 21 before you can bring it back since you got a waiver 22 last month for it. 23 ROSS APPEL: Yeah. So maybe Bo and I can 24 talk about this. 25 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: But we can -- yeah, you

April 18, 2018 164 1 all can discuss that. 2 ROSS APPEL: You all are freewheeling and 3 free-styling with sort of a lot of this stuff, but Bo 4 and I will work that out in due time. 5 Okay. So -- but for the purposes tonight, 6 we don't need to go forward with the variance. Thank 7 you. 8 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: So that case has been 9 withdrawn. And --10 ROSS APPEL: For the record, it has not 11 been withdrawn, ma'am. 12 CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Can I confer with our 13 attorney? 14 ROSS APPEL: I mean --15 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: It is not going forward 16 on the applicant's request. 17 ROSS APPEL: It's being deferred. We're 18 getting our one deferral by town ordinance. 19 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: You can grant a 20 referral. 21 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Whatever it is called, that's what is occurring, that's all I'm saying. 22 23 That's all I know. 24 ROSS APPEL: Yeah. I -- I don't know. You

25

know what -- are you the only (inaudible).

1	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Huh?
2	UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Please decide.
3	ROSS APPEL: So, legally, we're taking the
4	position it's being deferred, a voluntarily deferral.
5	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Okay.
6	ROSS APPEL: And it's our position that
7	that does not constitute a withdrawal.
8	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: That is fine. The
9	applicant is deferring the case.
10	ROSS APPEL: Okay.
11	CHAIRWOMAN LYON: Our next meeting is May
12	the 15th. We do have a potential case. If there's no
13	further business, this meeting stands adjourned.
14	(Inaudible conversation.)
15	(Audio ended.)
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

## CERTIFICATE OF TRANSCRIPTIONIST

I, Melissa Lane, Certified Court Reporter (MO), Certified Shorthand Reporter (IL), Registered Professional Reporter and Notary Public for the State of Missouri, do hereby certify that the foregoing tape transcription was produced to the best of my ability and may include inaudible sections and/or misinterpreted words or speakers.

I further certify that I am neither related to nor counsel for any party to the cause pending or interested in the events thereof.

Witness my hand, I have hereunto affixed my official seal this April 29, 2018.

Melissa J. Lane

Melissa Lane, CCR, CSR, RPR